## Supplemental Materials

## **Experiment 1**

*Materials.* The trait pool in Experiment 1 consisted of 6 positive traits (tolerant, likeable, funny, relaxed, caring, trustworthy) and 6 negative traits (resentful, dumb, faithless, choleric, withdrawn, egoistic). We used two different colored alien pictures from Gupta et al., 2004 to represent two different alien tribes.

Procedure. The experiment used the Qualtrics software. First, the computer program randomly draw 3 positive and 3 negative traits for the first alien tribe A and then depending on condition, either drew the same 3 positive and 3 different negative traits for the second alien tribe B (shared positive condition), or the same 3 negative traits and 3 different positive traits for tribe B (shared negative condition). The computer also randomly determined which of the two alien pictures represented tribe A and which represented tribe B. Instructions informed participants about confidentiality of the experiment and about their right to quit the experiment at any point. After answering demographical questions, participants were instructed to imagine that they would travel to a distant planet and that they would encounter several members of an alien tribe and that each member would display a character trait. Participants were further instructed that their task was to cautiously follow the presentation of aliens and their traits and to thereby form an impression about the alien tribe. Participant were then presented with all 6 traits of tribe A one at a time, in randomized order. On each trial, the trait word was flanked by the picture of the alien tribe along with the notion "A member of this tribe is...". To proceed from trial to trial, participants had to click on a continue button. After participants had seen all of tribe A's traits, they were shown a summary of all the traits next to the alien picture along with the instruction to take another look at the traits. After clicking the continue button, participants were navigated to the next screen on which they saw a picture of the novel alien tribe B and were told to imagine that they would travel on and encounter another alien tribe. They were further told that they would again meet several

members of this tribe and learn about their traits and that their task was again to form an impression about this alien tribe. Over 6 trials participatns were then presented with the 6 traits of tribe B and were also presented with a trait summary at the end. Finally, participants were presented with both alien pictures arranged next to each other and asked, "If you had to decide, which of the two alien tribes do you find more likeable?". Below each alien picture was a radio button and participants could only check one of them. When they indicated their preference, they could click on the continue button and were forwarded to a debriefing screen which informed participants about the purpose of the experiment. After a final click on the continue button, participants were given their personal completion key necessary to receive their Mturk compensation.

## **Experiment 2**

Materials. The trait pool in Experiment 2 consisted of 16 positive traits and 16 negative traits in German language. The positive traits included tolerant (tolerant), freundlich (friendly), ehrlich (honest), optimistisch (optimistic), klug (smart), gerecht (fair), warmherzig (caring), liebenswert (likeable), zuverlässig (reliable), friedlich (peaceful), entspannt (relaxed), humorvoll (funny), aufgeschlossen (receptive), lebensfroh (happy), talentiert (talented) and hilfsbereit (helpful). The negative traits included unehrlich (dishonest), geizig (stingy), arrogant (arrogant), unzuverlässig (unreliable), faul (lazy), verschlossen (withdrawn), verbittert (embittered), lügnerisch (deceptive), egoistisch (egoistic), manipulierend (manipulative), dumm (dumb), unfreundlich (unfriendly), hinterlistig (deceitful), ungeduldig (impatient), rechthaberisch (bossy), reizbar (irritable). Experiment 2 used the same two alien pictures as Experiment 1.

**Procedure.** The procedure of Experiment 2 was similar to Experiment 1 except that instructions were in German and that traits in the two conditions were sampled differently. That is, in one condition (negative diverse) the program randomly sampled 3 positive traits for each tribe separately but from the same randomly determined trait sub-set consisting of 4 positive traits, while the program sampled the

negative traits for both tribes separately from the whole set of 16 negative traits. In the other condition (positive diverse), negative traits were sampled from a 4 trait sub-set and positive traits were sampled from the complete trait set.

## **Experiment 3**

*Materials.* The trait pool in Experiment 3 consisted of 6 positive and 6 negative traits in German language. The positive traits included tolerant (tolerant), freundlich (friendly), ehrlich (honest), optimistisch (optimistic), klug (smart), and gerecht (fair). The negative traits included unsicher (insecure), geizig (stingy), arrogant (arrogant), unzuverlässig (unreliable), faul (lazy), and verschlossen (withdrawn). Experiment 3 used the same two alien pictures as the previous studies.

**Procedure.** The procedure of Experiment 2 was similar to Experiment 1 and 2 except that traits in the two conditions were sampled differently. That is, in one condition (positive frequent) the program randomly sampled 4 positive traits and 1 negative trait from the trait samples separately for each alien tribe while in other condition (negative frequent) the program sampled 4 negative traits and 1 positive trait for each alien tribe.