

Online Supplementary Material

Are smart sanctions smart enough?

An inquiry into when leaders oppress civilians under UN targeted sanctions

Jiyoun Park

Jeonbuk National University

Hyun Jin Choi

Kyung Hee University

This document provides the list of 56 smart sanction episodes between 1991 and 2016 and the results of robustness checks that could not be included in the text due to space constraints. Models 6-9 in Table A2 test whether our results are sensitive to the exclusion of some episodes and to a change in the operationalization of political institution. Here we exclude episodes where one of the purposes was to ‘signal’ a target’s violations of human rights. In addition, we increase the threshold level of Polyarchy index that is used to code the *autocracy* variable. It is now coded as 1 if the Polyarchy index is less than or equal to 0.25, and is coded 0 otherwise. In Models 10-14 of Table A3, we further test the robustness of our findings using an alternative measure of political terror scale – namely, the PTS-Amnesty – as a dependent variable, while otherwise keeping Models 6-9 unchanged.

These changes make no substantive difference for our main findings. The only exception is that there is no longer a significant interaction between *duration* and *coercion* in Model 6. Perhaps, this is because relatively small number of sanctions are effective in coercing a target’s behavior. Within our sample, sanctions with coercive purposes were effective only 17% of the time. In Model 11, on the other hand, the interaction between *duration* and *coercion* remains marginally significant ($p < .056$) in the expected direction. Also noteworthy in Model 10 is that *duration* has significant negative signs, suggesting that, on average, human rights conditions of target countries tend to improve over time during smart sanctions.

Table A1: List of 56 smart sanction episodes against the incumbent regime, 1991-2016

Target	Year	UNSC Resolution number(s)	Sanction type(s)
Cote D'Ivoire1	2004	1572/1584/1632/1633	Arms imports embargo, Travel ban, Financial sanctions, etc.
Cote D'Ivoire2	2005	1643/1708/1721/1727/1761/1765/1782	Arms imports embargo, Travel ban, Financial sanctions, Diamond exports ban etc.
Cote D'Ivoire3	2010	1962/1967/1968/1975	Arms imports embargo, Travel ban, Financial sanctions, Diamond exports ban etc.
Cote D'Ivoire4	2011	1980/2045	Arms imports embargo, Travel ban, Financial sanctions, Diamond exports ban(terminated in April 2014) etc.
DPRK1	2006	1718	Arm embargo, Luxury goods imports ban, Financial sanctions etc.
DPRK2	2009	1874	Arm embargo, Luxury goods imports ban, Travel ban, Financial sanctions etc.
DPRK3	2013	2094/2141/2207	Arm embargo, Luxury goods imports ban, Travel ban, Financial sanctions, Vessels port entry ban etc.
DPRK4	2016	2270	Arm embargo, Luxury goods imports ban, Travel ban, Financial sanctions, Commodity exports ban etc.
DRC1	2003	1493/1501/1533/1552/1595	Arms imports embargo
Ethiopia	2000	1298/1312	Arms imports embargo
Eritrea	2000	1298/1312	Arms imports embargo
Guinea-Bissau	2012	2048	Travel ban
Haiti1	1993	841	Arms imports embargo, Financial sanctions
Haiti2	1993	861	Arms imports embargo, Financial sanctions
Haiti3	1993	873	Arms imports embargo, Financial sanctions
Iran1	2006	1737	Goods and Technology imports and exports embargo, Financial sanctions
Iran2	2007	1747	Goods and Technology imports and exports embargo, Financial sanctions, Arms exports embargo
Iran3	2008	1803	Goods and Technology imports and exports embargo, Financial sanctions, Arms exports embargo, Travel ban
Iran4	2010	1929	Goods and Technology imports and exports embargo, Financial sanctions, Arms exports embargo, Travel ban etc.
Iran5	2013	2159/2224	Goods and Technology imports and exports embargo, Financial sanctions, Arms exports embargo, Travel ban etc.
Iran6	2016	2231	Goods and Technology imports and exports embargo, Financial sanctions, Arms exports embargo, Travel ban etc.
Iraq1	2003	1483/1511/1518	Arms imports embargo, Cultural property trade ban, Financial ban
Iraq2	2004	1546/1762/1958/1956/1957/2107	Arms imports embargo, Cultural property trade ban, Financial ban
Lebanon	2005	1636/1644/1664/1686/1748/1757/1815/1852	Travel ban, Financial Sanctions
Liberia1	1992	788/985	Arms imports embargo
Liberia2	2001	1343/1395/1408/1458	Arms imports embargo, Diamond exports ban, Travel ban
Liberia3	2003	1478/1497/1509	Arms imports embargo, Diamond exports ban, Travel ban
Liberia4	2003	1521	Arms imports embargo, Diamond exports ban, Travel ban, Financial sanctions
Liberia5	2006	1688/1689/1731/1750/1753/1760/1792/1819/1854/1903/1961	Arms imports embargo, Diamond exports ban, Travel ban, Financial sanctions
Libya1	1992	748	Arms imports embargo, Diplomatic sanctions
Libya2	1993	883	Arms imports embargo, Diplomatic sanctions, Financial sanctions
Libya3	1999	1506	Arms imports embargo, Diplomatic sanctions, Financial sanctions, Oil service equipment ban
Libya4	2011	1970	Arms imports and exports embargo, Travel ban, Financial sanctions

Libya5	2011	1973	Arms imports and exports embargo, Travel ban, Financial sanctions etc.
Libya6	2011	2009/2016/2040	Arms imports and exports embargo, Travel ban, Financial sanctions etc.
Libya7	2014	2146/2174/2208/2213/2240/2259/2278/2292/2298	Arms imports and exports embargo, Travel ban, Financial sanctions etc.
Rwanda1	1994	918/929/955/997/1005	Arms imports embargo
Rwanda2	1995	1011/1013/1534/1749/1823	Arms imports embargo
Sierra Leone1	1997	1132	Arms and petroleum imports ban, Travel ban
Somalia1	1992	733/751/794/1356/	Arms imports embargo
Somalia2	2002	1407/1425/1474/1519/1558/1587/1630/1676/1724/1725/1744/1766/1772/1801/1811/1814/1816/1838	Arms imports embargo
Somalia3	2008	1844/1846/1851/1853/1863/1872/1897/	Arms imports embargo, Travel ban, Financial sanctions
Somalia4	2009	1907/1916/1950/1964/1972/2002/2020/2023	Arms imports embargo, Travel ban, Financial sanctions, Secondary sanctions etc.
Eritrea1	1992	733/751/794/1356/	Arms imports embargo
Eritrea2	2002	1407/1425/1474/1519/1558/1587/1630/1676/1724/1725/1744/1766/1772/1801/1811/1814/1816/1838	Arms imports embargo
Eritrea3	2008	1844/1846/1851/1853/1863/1872/1897/	Arms imports embargo, Travel ban, Financial sanctions
Eritrea4	2009	1907/1916/1950/1964/1972/2002/2020/2023	Arms imports embargo, Travel ban, Financial sanctions, Secondary sanctions etc.
Eritrea5	2012	2036/2060/2077/2093/2111/2125/2142/2182/2184/2244/2246	Arms imports embargo, Travel ban, Financial sanctions, Secondary sanctions etc.
South Sudan	2015	2206/2241/2271/2280/2290	Travel ban, Financial Sanctions
Sudan1	1996	1054	Diplomatic sanctions
Sudan2	1996	1070/1372	Diplomatic sanctions, Aviation ban
Sudan3	2004	1556/1564/1590	Arms imports embargo
Sudan4	2005	1591/1593/1651/1665/1672/1706/1713/1779/1841/1891/1945/1982/2035/2091/2138/2200/2265	Arms imports embargo, Travel ban, Financial sanctions, etc.
Yemen	2015	2216/2266	Arms imports embargo, Travel ban, Financial sanctions
FRY1	1991	713/724/743	Arms imports embargo
FRY2	1998	1160/1199/1203/1244/1376	Arms imports embargo

Table A2: Determinants of Change in Political Terror Scale (PTS-US) during Smart Sanctions, after excluding episodes whose purpose was to ‘signal’ a target’s violations of human rights and using an alternative measure of *autocracy* (Polyarchy index ≤ 0.25)

VARIABLES	Model 6	Model 7	Model 8	Model 9
Duration	-0.055 (0.044)	-0.078 (0.028)***	-0.028 (0.036)	-0.088 (0.021)***
Duration × Scope	0.049 (0.021)**	0.062 (0.013)***	0.073 (0.017)***	0.051 (0.017)***
Duration × Coercion	-0.011 (0.008)			
Duration × Constraint		-0.011 (0.004)***		
Duration × Signaling			-0.018 (0.005)***	
Duration × Effective				-0.139 (0.025)***
Duration × Autocracy	0.121 (0.048)**	0.117 (0.055)**	0.091 (0.047)*	0.106 (0.046)**
GDP per capita	-0.082 (0.026)***	-0.040 (0.025)	-0.042 (0.025)*	-0.051 (0.024)**
Civil war	0.516 (0.124)***	0.448 (0.118)***	0.465 (0.110)***	0.460 (0.105)***
US Sanction	0.217 (0.533)	0.475 (0.354)	0.464 (0.332)	0.535 (0.345)
Scope	0.404 (0.189)**	0.105 (0.168)	0.037 (0.143)	0.129 (0.161)
Coercion	-0.047 (0.023)**			
Constraint		-0.005 (0.017)		
Signaling			0.025 (0.028)	
Effective				-0.229 (0.192)
Autocracy	-0.065 (0.173)	-0.084 (0.169)	-0.067 (0.159)	-0.069 (0.151)
Constant	3.623 (0.449)***	3.468 (0.387)***	3.307 (0.449)***	3.405 (0.370)***
Number of observations	177	206	232	232
Number of sanctions	44	50	55	55
R-squared (within)	0.173	0.248	0.246	0.232

Notes: Robust standard errors in parentheses, *** p<0.01, ** p<0.05, * p<0.1

Table A3: Determinants of Change in Political Terror Scale (PTS-Amnesty) during Smart Sanctions

VARIABLES	Model 10	Model 11	Model 12	Model 13	Model 14
Duration	-0.061 (0.029)**	-0.089 (0.041)**	-0.099 (0.029)***	-0.076 (0.033)**	-0.135 (0.025)***
Duration $\times$ Scope		0.057 (0.034)*	0.068 (0.017)***	0.072 (0.017)***	0.048 (0.018)***
Duration $\times$ Coercion		-0.015 (0.008)*			
Duration $\times$ Constraint			-0.016 (0.004)***		
Duration $\times$ Signaling				-0.017 (0.007)**	
Duration $\times$ Effective					-0.134 (0.046)***
Duration $\times$ Autocracy		0.118 (0.042)***	0.138 (0.043)***	0.121 (0.037)***	0.138 (0.041)***
GDP per capita	-0.085 (0.032)***	-0.135 (0.024)***	-0.067 (0.035)*	-0.083 (0.034)**	-0.091 (0.032)***
Civil war	0.806 (0.129)***	0.713 (0.115)***	0.729 (0.106)***	0.751 (0.099)***	0.752 (0.102)***
US Sanction	0.502 (0.231)**	0.352 (0.384)	0.388 (0.245)	0.376 (0.235)	0.418 (0.236)*
Scope		0.253 (0.161)	0.073 (0.138)	0.021 (0.129)	0.100 (0.126)
Coercion		-0.022 (0.022)			
Constraint			0.008 (0.015)		
Signaling				0.025 (0.022)	
Effective					-0.105 (0.175)
Autocracy		-0.007 (0.190)	0.061 (0.186)	0.011 (0.167)	-0.006 (0.166)
Constant	3.569 (0.256)***	3.689 (0.354)***	3.471 (0.274)***	3.431 (0.337)***	3.542 (0.275)***
Number of observations	218	169	193	218	218
Number of sanctions	55	44	50	55	55
R-squared (within)	0.208	0.177	0.370	0.347	0.327

Notes: Robust standard errors in parentheses, *** p<0.01, ** p<0.05, * p<0.1