

1. Attention check

The attention check that we presented to participants at the end of Experiment 1 and Experiment 2 was the following:

Now imagine you are playing video games with a friend and at some point your friend says:

“I don’t want to play this game anymore! To make sure that you read the instructions, please write the three following words "I pay attention" in the box below. I really dislike this game.”

Do you agree with you friend?

[Open text entry]

2. Vignettes of Experiment 1

When information of low practical relevance was presented first, the order of the speaker was reversed, i.e. Alex’s dialogue became Tom’s and vice versa.

Positive and negative feedback are between hooks in the appendix but where not during the experiment.

“*[Page break]*” signify participants had to click on an arrow and went to next page.

When participants received no feedback, questions of thankfulness and knowledgeability where asked right after the presentation of the dialogue.

RESTAURANT

Imagine you are talking with your friend Alex about local restaurants. At some point they say:

“Le Cosi always serves amazing food”

[Page break]

Later the same day, you talk with your friend Tom about the same topic, and he tells you:

“Loulou usually serves pretty good food”

[Page break]

As a quick reminder:

Alex said: “Le Cosi always serves amazing food”

Tom said: “Loulou usually serves pretty good food”

Which friend are you **most** thankful towards for the recommendation?

Alex – Tom

[Page break]

After a few visits to the restaurants, you come to think that the recommendations of both Alex and Tom were [wrong/right].

[Page break]

As a quick reminder:

Alex said: “Le Cosi always serves amazing food”

Tom said: “Loulou usually serves pretty good food”

After a few visits to the restaurants, you come to think that the recommendations of both Alex and Tom were [wrong/right].

Which friend are you [**least/most**] thankful towards for the recommendation?

Alex – Tom

Which friend do you think is [**less/more**] knowledgeable about restaurants?

Alex – Tom

CONCERT

Imagine you are talking with your friend Alex about live music. At some point they say:
“The band Dark Poem is always amazing in concert, you should see them live!”

[Page break]

Later the same day, you talk with your friend Tom about the same topic, and he tells you:
“The band Winter Flowers is usually pretty good in concert, you should see them live!”

[Page break]

As a quick reminder:

Alex said: “The band Dark Poem is always amazing in concert, you should see them live!”

Tom said: “The band Winter Flowers is usually pretty good in concert, you should see them live!”

Which friend are you **most** thankful towards for the recommendation?

Alex – Tom

[Page break]

After going to the concert of Winter Flowers and Dark Poem and watching some lives on the internet, you come to think that what Alex and Tom had told you is [wrong/right].

[Page break]

As a quick reminder:

Alex said: “The band Dark Poem is always amazing in concert, you should see them live!”

Tom said: “The band Winter Flowers is usually pretty good in concert, you should see them live!”

After going to the concert of Winter Flowers and Dark Poem and watching some lives on the internet, you come to think that what Alex and Tom had told you is [wrong/right].

Which friend are you [**least/most**] thankful towards for the recommendation?

Alex – Tom

Which friend do you think is [**less/more**] knowledgeable about live music?

Alex – Tom

GALLERY

Imagine you are talking with your friend Alex about art galleries. At some point they say:
"Exhibitions at the Art Factory are always amazing. You should visit the gallery!"

[Page break]

Later the same day, you talk with your friend Tom about the same topic, and he tells you:
"Exhibitions at the Black Bird are usually pretty good. You should visit the gallery!"

[Page break]

As a quick reminder:

Alex said: "Exhibitions at the Art Factory are always amazing. You should visit the gallery!"

Tom said: "Exhibitions at the Black Bird are usually pretty good. You should visit the gallery!"

Which friend are you **most** thankful towards for the recommendation?

Alex – Tom

[Page break]

After going to the Art Factory and the Black Bird several times, you come to think that the recommendations of both Alex and Tom were [wrong/right].

[Page break]

As a quick reminder:

Alex said: "Exhibitions at the Art Factory are always amazing. You should visit the gallery!"

Tom said: "Exhibitions at the Black Bird are usually pretty good. You should visit the gallery!"
After going to the Art Factory and the Black Bird several times, you come to think that the recommendations of both Alex and Tom were [wrong/right].

Which friend are you [**least/most**] thankful towards for the recommendation?

Alex – Tom

Which friend do you think is [**less/more**] knowledgeable about art galleries?

Alex – Tom

THEATER

Imagine you are talking with your friend Alex about theater plays. At some point they say:
“The programming is usually pretty good at the Renaud theater, you should go see a play there!”

[Page break]

Later the same day, you talk with your friend Tom about the same topic, and he tells you:
“The programming is always amazing at the Odeon theater, you should go see a play there!”

[Page break]

As a quick reminder:

Alex said: “The programming is always amazing at the Odeon theater, you should go see a play there!”

Tom said: “The programming is usually pretty good at the Renaud theater, you should go see a play there!”

Which friend are you **most** thankful towards for the recommendation?

Alex – Tom

[Page break]

After seeing a few plays from the Odeon and the Renaud, you come to think that the recommendations of both Alex and Tom were [wrong/right].

[Page break]

As a quick reminder:

Alex said: “The programming is always amazing at the Odeon theater, you should go see a play there!”

Tom said: “The programming is usually pretty good at the Renaud theater, you should go see a play there!”

After seeing a few plays from the Odeon and the Renaud, you come to think that the recommendations of both Alex and Tom were [wrong/right].

Which friend are you [**least/most**] thankful towards for the recommendation?

Alex – Tom

Which friend do you think is [**less/more**] knowledgeable about theater plays?

Alex – Tom

3. Vignettes of Experiment 2

When the vague information was presented first, the order of the speaker was reversed, i.e. Alex’s dialogue became Tom’s and vice versa.

RESTAURANT

Imagine you are visiting Paris, and are looking for a good restaurant.

[Page break]

As you talk about it with your friend Tom, he says:

“Le Cusi and Bofinger are great restaurants, you should definitely try one of them.”

[Page break]

Later in the day, you talk about this with your friend Alex who says: “There are some great restaurants in the 4th district of Paris, you should definitely try one of them.”

[Page break]

As a quick reminder:

Tom said: “Le Cosi and Bofinger are great restaurants, you should definitely try one of them.”

Alex Said: “There are some great restaurants in the 4th district of Paris, you should definitely try one of them.”

Which friend are you **most** thankful towards for the recommendation?

Tom – Alex

[Page break]

After a few visits to restaurants in the 4th district of Paris, including Le Cosi and Bofinger, you come to think that the recommendations of both Tom and Alex were [right/wrong].

As a quick reminder:

Tom said: “Le Cosi and Bofinger are great restaurants, you should definitely try one of them.”

Alex Said: “There are some great restaurants in the 4th district of Paris, you should definitely try one of them.”

After a few visits to restaurants in the 4th district of Paris, including Le Cosi and Bofinger, you came to think that the recommendations of both Tom and Alex were right.

Which friend are you [**least/most**] thankful towards for the recommendation?

Tom – Alex

Which friend do you think is [**less/more**] knowledgeable about restaurants in Paris?

Tom - Alex

A few months later, you're back in Paris and are looking for new restaurants. Who would you ask for a recommendation?

Tom – Alex

THEATER

Imagine you are visiting Paris, and are looking for a good play.

[Page break]

As you talk about it with your friend Tom, he says:

“Edmond and Kean are great plays being given at the moment, you should definitely see one of them.”

[Page break]

Later in the day, you talk about this with your friend Alex who says: “There are some great plays being given at the moment in the left bank of Paris, you should definitely see one of them.”

[Page break]

As a quick reminder:

Tom said: “Edmond and Kean are great plays being given at the moment, you should definitely see one of them.”

Alex Said: “There are some great plays being given at the moment in the left bank of Paris, you should definitely see one of them.”

Which friend are you **most** thankful towards for the recommendation?

Tom – Alex

[Page break]

After seeing a few plays in the left bank of Paris, including Edmond and Kean, you come to

think that the recommendations of both Tom and Alex were [right/wrong].

[Page break]

As a quick reminder:

Tom said: “Edmond and Kean are great plays being given at the moment, you should definitely see one of them.”

Alex Said: “There are some great plays being given at the moment in the left bank of Paris, you should definitely see one of them.”

After seeing a few plays in the left bank of Paris, including Edmond and Kean, you came to think that the recommendations of both Tom and Alex were wrong.

Which friend are you [**most/least**] thankful towards for the recommendation?

Tom-Alex

Which friend do you think is [**more/less**] knowledgeable about plays in Paris?

Tom-Alex

A few months later, you're back in Paris and are looking for a new play. Who would you ask for a recommendation?

Tom-Alex

HR (Human Resources)

Imagine you work in a large company, and are encountering some issues that make you want to talk to someone about them.

[Page break]

As you talk about this with Tom, one of your colleague, he says: “You should see someone at HR, Laure in particular is really helpful”

[Page break]

Later in the day, you talk about this with Alex, another of your colleague, who says: “You should see someone at HR, some of the people there are really helpful.”

[Page break]

As a quick reminder:

Tom said: “You should see someone at HR, Laure in particular is really helpful”

Alex Said: “You should see someone at HR, some of the people there are really helpful.”

Which friend are you **most** thankful towards for the recommendation?

Tom – Alex

[Page break]

After talking to a few people at HR, including Laure, you come to think that the recommendations of both Tom and Alex were [right/wrong].

[Page break]

As a quick reminder:

Tom said: “You should see someone at HR, Laure in particular is really helpful”

Alex Said: “You should see someone at HR, some of the people there are really helpful.”

After talking to a few people at HR, including Laure, you came to think that the recommendations of both Tom and Alex were right.

Which friend are you **[most/least]** thankful towards for the recommendation?

Tom – Alex

Which friend do you think is **[more/less]** knowledgeable about HR in the company?

Tom - Alex

A year later, you're thinking of talking to HR again, but the employee you talked to last time left the company. Who would you ask for a recommendation?

Tom – Alex

JAZZ

Imagine you want to bring a date to a Jazz Club in the new city you've recently moved to, but don't know where to go.

As you talk about it with your friend Tom, he says: "The Star and Chez Papa are great Jazz Club, you should go to one of them!"

Later in the day, you talk about this with your friend Alex who says: "There are some great Jazz Club in the old town, you should go to one of them!"

As a quick reminder:

Tom said: "The Star and Chez Papa are great Jazz Club, you should go to one of them!"

Alex Said: "There are some great Jazz Club in the old town, you should go to one of them!"

Which friend are you most thankful towards for the recommendation?

Tom – Alex

After a few visits to jazz clubs in the old town, including The Star and Chez Papa, you come to think that the recommendations of both Tom and Alex were [right/wrong].

As a quick reminder:

Tom said: "The Star and Chez Papa are great Jazz Club, you should go to one of them!"

Alex Said: "There are some great Jazz Club in the old town, you should go to one of them!"

After a few visits to jazz clubs in the old town, including The Star and Chez Papa, you came to think that the recommendations of both Tom and Alex were wrong.

Which friend are you [**most/least**] thankful towards for the recommendation?

Tom – Alex

Which friend do you think is [more/less] knowledgeable about Jazz Clubs?

Tom – Alex

A few weeks later, you're looking for a new Jazz club to go to. Who would you ask for a recommendation?

Tom – Alex

4. Detailed results of Experiment 1

All the chi-square tests reported are chi-square goodness of fit tests.

In the No feedback condition, participants were more thankful towards the advisor giving the more relevant advice (74%, 102/137; $\chi^2(1, N = 137) = 32.77, p < .001, \phi = 0.49$), they deemed her slightly—but not significantly - more knowledgeable (57%, 78/137; $\chi^2(1, N = 137) = 2.64, p = .10, \phi = 0.14$), and selected her as advisor in the future more often (61%, 83/137; $\chi^2(1, N = 137) = 6.14, p = .01, \phi = 0.21$).

In the Positive feedback condition, participants were more thankful towards the advisor giving the advice of high practical relevance (76%, 103/137; $\chi^2(1, N = 137) = 36.80, p < .001, \phi = 0.52$), they deemed her more knowledgeable (61%, 83/137; $\chi^2(1, N = 137) = 6.14, p = .01, \phi = 0.21$), but they did not selected her significantly more often as advisor in the future, even if the effect goes in the expected direction (54%, 74/137; $\chi^2(1, N = 137) = 0.88, p = .35$).

In the Negative feedback condition, participants were least thankful toward the advisor giving the advice of high practical relevance (92%, 111/121; $\chi^2(1, N = 121) = 84.31, p < .001, \phi = 0.83$), they believed her to be less competent (89%, 108/121; $\chi^2(1, N = 121) = 74.59, p < .001, \phi = 0.79$), and selected her less often as advisor in the future (8%, 10/121; $\chi^2(1, N = 121) = 84.31, p < .001, \phi = 0.83$).

5. Detailed results of Experiment 2

All the chi-square tests reported are chi-square goodness of fit tests.

When given no feedback, participants were more thankful toward the adviser giving the advice of high practical relevance (89%, 118/132; $\chi^2(1, N = 132) = 81.94, p < .001, \phi = 0.79$), they deemed her to be more knowledgeable (78%, 103/132; $\chi^2(1, N = 132) = 41.49, p < .001, \phi = 0.56$), and selected her as a source of future recommendations more often (83%, 109/132; $\chi^2(1, N = 132) = 56.03, p < .001, \phi = 0.65$).

When the information was revealed to be true, participants were more thankful toward the adviser giving the advice of high practical relevance (81%, 105/130; $\chi^2(1, N = 130) = 49.23, p < .001, \phi = 0.62$), they deemed her to be more knowledgeable (82%, 106/130; $\chi^2(1, N = 130) = 51.72, p < .001, \phi = 0.63$), and selected her more often as a source of future recommendations (73%, 95/130; $\chi^2(1, N = 130) = 27.69, p < .001$).

When the advice was revealed to be false, participants were least thankful toward the adviser giving the advice of high practical relevance (64%, 83/130; $\chi^2(1, N = 130) = 9.99, p < .01, \phi = 0.28$), they deemed her slightly—but not significantly—more competent (57%, 74/130; $\chi^2(1, N = 130) = 2.49, p = .11, \phi = 0.14$), and they selected her less often as a source of future recommendations (40%, 52/130; $\chi^2(1, N = 130) = 5.2, p = .02, \phi = 0.20$). We suspect that the advisor giving the advice of high practical relevance if true was not deemed less competent because the mere fact of knowing the name of two jazz clubs, restaurants, theaters or a HR is a strong cue of knowledgeability on these topics. Moreover, since the topics are mostly subjective, one could deem an informant not very relevant and not select her as a source of information in the future because of strong taste differences, and at the same time deem her knowledgeable on these topics. Indeed, laypeople and experts are more relativists when it

comes to taste than more objective knowledge such as scientific knowledge (e.g. Kuhn et al., 2000). This interpretation is coherent with the fact that advisors of more relevant if true advice on jazz clubs were not punished at all when wrong.

6. Pre-test Experiment 1

We recruited 49 U.S., U.K., Ireland, participants online (32 women, $M_{Age} = 35.65$, $SD = 11.39$), using Prolific Academic. Participants were paid 0.2£.

Participants deemed advices with the most intense quantifiers (“amazing” compared to “pretty good”) to be more useful (79.59%, 39/49; $\chi^2(1, N = 49) = 17.16$, $p < .001$, $\phi = 0.59$).

7. Pre-test Experiment 2

We recruited 51 U.S., U.K., Ireland, participants online (30 women, $M_{Age} = 32.59$, $SD = 10.55$), using Prolific Academic. Participants were paid 0.2£.

Participants deemed the more precise advices to be more useful (80.39%, 41/51; $\chi^2(1, N = 51) = 18.84$, $p < .001$, $\phi = 0.61$).

8. Descriptive information

In each of the table below, participants’ answers are shown as a function of the topic.

Experiment 1

No feedback condition

Most thankful toward:

Topic	Most relevant adviser	Least relevant adviser
Concert	24	9
Galery	25	10
Restaurant	27	7
Theater	26	9

More knowledgeable:

Topic	Most relevant adviser	Least relevant adviser
Concert	20	13
Galery	18	17
Restaurant	18	16
Theater	22	13

Selected as a source of information in the future:

Topic	Most relevant adviser	Least relevant adviser
Concert	22	11
Galery	18	17
Restaurant	20	14
Theater	23	12

Positive feedback condition

Most thankful toward:

Topic	Most relevant adviser	Least relevant adviser
Concert	24	10
Galery	26	8
Restaurant	27	7
Theater	27	8

More knowledgeable:

Topic	Most relevant adviser	Least relevant adviser
Concert	19	15
Galery	22	12
Restaurant	20	14
Theater	22	13

Selected as a source of information in the future:

Topic	Most relevant adviser	Least relevant adviser
Concert	21	13
Galery	11	23

Restaurant	20	14
Theater	22	13

Negative feedback condition

Least thankful toward:

Topic	Most relevant adviser	Least relevant adviser
Concert	34	2
Galery	31	3
Restaurant	30	4
Theater	16	1

Least knowledgeable:

Topic	Most relevant adviser	Least relevant adviser
Concert	34	2
Galery	28	6
Restaurant	30	4
Theater	16	1

Selected as a source of information in the future:

Topic	Most relevant adviser	Least relevant adviser
Concert	2	34
Galery	4	30
Restaurant	3	31
Theater	1	16

Experiment 2

No feedback condition

Most thankful toward:

Topic	Most relevant adviser	Least relevant adviser
HR	31	2
Jazz	30	3
Restaurant	32	1

Theater	25	8
----------------	----	---

More knowledgeable:

Topic	Most relevant adviser	Least relevant adviser
HR	29	4
Jazz	29	4
Restaurant	22	11
Theater	23	10

Selected as a source of information in the future:

Topic	Most relevant adviser	Least relevant adviser
HR	28	5
Jazz	29	4
Restaurant	27	6
Theater	25	8

Positive feedback condition

Most thankful toward:

Topic	Most relevant adviser	Least relevant adviser
HR	31	1
Jazz	29	4
Restaurant	23	10
Theater	22	10

More knowledgeable:

Topic	Most relevant adviser	Least relevant adviser
HR	24	8
Jazz	29	4
Restaurant	27	6
Theater	26	6

Selected as a source of information in the future:

Topic	Most relevant adviser	Least relevant adviser
HR	22	10

Jazz	24	9
Restaurant	21	12
Theater	28	4

Negative feedback condition

Least thankful toward:

Topic	Most relevant adviser	Least relevant adviser
HR	23	10
Jazz	15	15
Restaurant	21	12
Theater	24	10

Least knowledgeable:

Topic	Most relevant adviser	Least relevant adviser
HR	17	16
Jazz	7	23
Restaurant	16	17
Theater	16	18

Selected as a source of information in the future:

Topic	Most relevant adviser	Least relevant adviser
HR	10	23
Jazz	19	11
Restaurant	11	22
Theater	12	22