Propagated preferences? Political elite discourses and Europeans’ openness toward Muslim immigrants

Appendix

Table A1: Descriptives by country

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Outcomes: attitudes toward… | | | |
|  | Muslim immigrants | | ethnically similar immigrants | |
| country | mean | SD | mean | SD |
| Austria | 2.708 | 0.919 | 2.216 | 0.826 |
| Belgium | 2.602 | 0.904 | 2.191 | 0.802 |
| Switzerland | 2.478 | 0.867 | 1.924 | 0.613 |
| Czech Republic | 3.436 | 0.743 | 2.676 | 0.818 |
| Germany | 2.151 | 0.867 | 1.672 | 0.699 |
| Denmark | 2.436 | 0.883 | 1.928 | 0.687 |
| Estonia | 3.040 | 0.936 | 2.096 | 0.751 |
| Spain | 2.612 | 0.985 | 2.178 | 0.903 |
| Finland | 2.704 | 0.883 | 2.206 | 0.729 |
| France | 2.373 | 0.874 | 2.142 | 0.765 |
| United Kingdom | 2.541 | 0.911 | 2.372 | 0.804 |
| Hungary | 3.443 | 0.718 | 2.403 | 0.936 |
| Ireland | 2.744 | 0.946 | 2.354 | 0.860 |
| Netherlands | 2.465 | 0.875 | 2.152 | 0.741 |
| Norway | 2.223 | 0.838 | 1.858 | 0.682 |
| Poland | 2.914 | 0.920 | 2.155 | 0.795 |
| Portugal | 2.869 | 0.919 | 2.349 | 0.791 |
| Sweden | 1.820 | 0.801 | 1.605 | 0.595 |
| Slovenia | 2.563 | 0.903 | 2.112 | 0.769 |

Table A1 continued

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Country-level | | | |
|  | Exclusionary discourse | Inclusionary discourse | Percent foreigners | Percent Muslims | Unemployment rate |
| country | mean | mean | mean | mean | mean |
| Austria | 0.789 | 0.564 | 0.563 | 0.716 | 0.102 |
| Belgium | 0.119 | 0.305 | 0.518 | 0.784 | 0.240 |
| Switzerland | 0.707 | 0.635 | 1.000 | 0.649 | 0.050 |
| Czech Republic | 0.112 | 0.005 | 0.201 | 0.000 | 0.125 |
| Germany | 0.295 | 0.446 | 0.415 | 0.770 | 0.071 |
| Denmark | 0.785 | 0.813 | 0.253 | 0.541 | 0.148 |
| Estonia | 1.000 | 0.475 | 0.313 | 0.000 | 0.185 |
| Spain | 0.000 | 0.126 | 0.440 | 0.270 | 1.000 |
| Finland | 0.399 | 0.623 | 0.145 | 0.095 | 0.247 |
| France | 0.346 | 0.049 | 0.387 | 1.000 | 0.325 |
| United Kingdom | 0.364 | 0.128 | 0.396 | 0.635 | 0.125 |
| Hungary | 0.987 | 0.270 | 0.104 | 0.027 | 0.202 |
| Ireland | 0.077 | 0.543 | 0.552 | 0.135 | 0.371 |
| Netherlands | 0.270 | 0.210 | 0.372 | 0.797 | 0.188 |
| Norway | 0.328 | 1.000 | 0.456 | 0.486 | 0.000 |
| Poland | 0.088 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.263 |
| Portugal | 0.157 | 0.306 | 0.243 | 0.068 | 0.497 |
| Sweden | 0.215 | 0.994 | 0.536 | 0.608 | 0.213 |
| Slovenia | 0.185 | 0.069 | 0.540 | 0.473 | 0.295 |

Table A1 continued

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Individual-level | | | |  |
|  | LR-scale | | Political interest | |  |
| country | mean | SD | mean | SD | N |
| Austria | 0.485 | 0.175 | 2.445 | 0.909 | 1,214 |
| Belgium | 0.512 | 0.206 | 2.558 | 0.899 | 1,275 |
| Switzerland | 0.534 | 0.198 | 2.160 | 0.793 | 813 |
| Czech Republic | 0.498 | 0.222 | 3.106 | 0.779 | 1,563 |
| Germany | 0.454 | 0.188 | 2.096 | 0.770 | 2,291 |
| Denmark | 0.556 | 0.233 | 2.114 | 0.764 | 1,215 |
| Estonia | 0.555 | 0.198 | 2.495 | 0.773 | 975 |
| Spain | 0.438 | 0.211 | 2.587 | 0.923 | 1,272 |
| Finland | 0.562 | 0.199 | 2.402 | 0.788 | 1,795 |
| France | 0.508 | 0.239 | 2.498 | 0.931 | 1,284 |
| United Kingdom | 0.502 | 0.199 | 2.339 | 0.908 | 1,482 |
| Hungary | 0.540 | 0.234 | 2.915 | 0.859 | 1,172 |
| Ireland | 0.514 | 0.183 | 2.608 | 0.966 | 1,471 |
| Netherlands | 0.520 | 0.187 | 2.260 | 0.760 | 1,455 |
| Norway | 0.533 | 0.210 | 2.467 | 0.748 | 1,154 |
| Poland | 0.577 | 0.232 | 2.659 | 0.799 | 1,131 |
| Portugal | 0.490 | 0.270 | 2.745 | 0.992 | 936 |
| Sweden | 0.513 | 0.241 | 2.200 | 0.799 | 1,31 |
| Slovenia | 0.450 | 0.246 | 2.509 | 0.877 | 721 |

Table A2: Estimates with re-sampling

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Country excluded | Excl. Discourse on Muslim attitudes | Excl. Discourse on same race attitudes | Incl. Discourse on Muslim attitudes | Incl. Discourse on same race attitudes |
| AT | 0.384\*\*\* | 0.001 | -0.594\*\*\* | -0.388\*\* |
| BE | 0.461\*\*\* | 0.059 | -0.578\*\*\* | -0.382\*\* |
| CH | 0.443\*\*\* | 0.082 | -0.616\*\*\* | -0.426\*\*\* |
| CZ | 0.508\*\*\* | 0.110 | -0.487\*\*\* | -0.311\* |
| DE | 0.401\*\*\* | 0.002 | -0.594\*\*\* | -0.383\*\*\* |
| DK | 0.392\*\*\* | 0.018 | -0.628\*\*\* | -0.421\*\* |
| EE | 0.451\*\*\* | 0.099 | -0.597\*\*\* | -0.395\*\* |
| ES | 0.400\*\*\* | 0.047 | -0.601\*\*\* | -0.386\*\* |
| FI | 0.415\*\*\* | 0.050 | -0.588\*\*\* | -0.422\*\* |
| FR | 0.428\*\*\* | 0.043 | -0.608\*\*\* | -0.389\*\* |
| GB | 0.417\*\*\* | 0.044 | -0.624\*\*\* | -0.339\*\* |
| HU | 0.390\*\*\* | 0.060 | -0.579\*\*\* | -0.391\*\* |
| IE | 0.425\*\*\* | 0.089 | -0.595\*\*\* | -0.409\*\*\* |
| NL | 0.419\*\*\* | 0.046 | -0.585\*\*\* | -0.378\*\* |
| NO | 0.440\*\*\* | 0.054 | -0.628\*\*\* | -0.405\*\* |
| PL | 0.366\*\*\* | -0.035 | -0.625\*\*\* | -0.441\*\*\* |
| PT | 0.410\*\*\* | 0.043 | -0.588\*\*\* | -0.388\*\* |
| SE | 0.373\*\*\* | -0.002 | -0.500\*\*\* | -0.294\* |
| SI | 0.408\*\*\* | 0.034 | -0.632\*\*\* | -0.424\*\* |
| Jackknife | 0.417\*\* | 0.042 | -0.592\*\* | -0.387\* |

p < 0.05. \*\* p < 0.01. \*\*\*p < 0.001 (two-sided tests)

Table A3: Alternative models

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Reduced sample (w/o FR, IE & SI) | | Mixed effects ordered logit | |
|  | Muslim | ethnically similar | Muslim | ethnically similar |
| *Country-level* | |  |  |  |
| Exclusionary discourse | 0.433\*\*\* | 0.0921 | 0.990\*\*\* | 0.164 |
|  | (3.87) | (0.71) | (0.244) | (0.314) |
| Inclusionary discourse | -0.661\*\*\* | -0.456\*\*\* | -1.398\*\*\* | -1.017\*\* |
|  | (-5.74) | (-3.44) | (0.246) | (0.316) |
| Share foreigners | 0.167 | 0.0600 | 0.366 | 0.339 |
|  | (0.87) | (0.27) | (0.389) | (0.500) |
| Share Muslims | -0.584\*\*\* | -0.0976 | -1.496\*\*\* | -0.511 |
|  | (-4.08) | (-0.59) | (0.253) | (0.326) |
| Unemployment rate | -0.182 | -0.0773 | -0.462 | -0.202 |
|  | (-1.12) | (-0.41) | (0.372) | (0.479) |
| *Individual-level* | |  |  |  |
| LR-scale | 0.565\*\*\* | 0.317\*\*\* | 1.401\*\*\* | 1.007\*\*\* |
|  | (21.51) | (13.26) | (0.059) | (0.059) |
| Political interest (ref.: none) | | |  |  |
| Very interested | -0.407\*\*\* | -0.412\*\*\* | -0.933\*\*\* | -1.021\*\*\* |
|  | (-17.08) | (-19.02) | (0.052) | (0.053) |
| Quite interested | -0.309\*\*\* | -0.311\*\*\* | -0.692\*\*\* | -0.724\*\*\* |
|  | (-16.22) | (-17.96) | (0.041) | (0.042) |
| Hardly interested | -0.163\*\*\* | -0.178\*\*\* | -0.378\*\*\* | -0.391\*\*\* |
|  | (-8.76) | (-10.52) | (0.041) | (0.041) |
| Gender: Female | 0.00445 | -0.0324\*\* | -0.0135 | -0.0904\*\*\* |
|  | (0.40) | (-3.17) | (0.025) | (0.025) |
| Age | 0.663\*\*\* | 0.214\*\*\* | 1.507\*\*\* | 0.580\*\*\* |
|  | (23.44) | (8.32) | (0.063) | (0.063) |
| Migrant friends (ref.: many) | | |  |  |
| A few | 0.203\*\*\* | 0.0987\*\*\* | 0.521\*\*\* | 0.371\*\*\* |
|  | (10.48) | (5.60) | (0.044) | (0.045) |
| None | 0.412\*\*\* | 0.233\*\*\* | 1.019\*\*\* | 0.716\*\*\* |
|  | (21.43) | (13.31) | (0.044) | (0.045) |
| Looking for work | -0.00674 | 0.0107 | -0.0597 | -0.0136 |
|  | (-0.26) | (0.45) | (0.055) | (0.057) |
| Education (ref.: high (tertiary)) | | |  |  |
| Medium (Advanced Vocational) | 0.207\*\*\* | 0.114\*\*\* | 0.483\*\*\* | 0.348\*\*\* |
|  | (10.85) | (6.58) | (0.041) | (0.043) |
| Medium (Upper Secondary) | 0.323\*\*\* | 0.222\*\*\* | 0.762\*\*\* | 0.643\*\*\* |
|  | (20.93) | (15.83) | (0.034) | (0.035) |
| Low (Lower Secondary or Less) | 0.377\*\*\* | 0.274\*\*\* | 0.912\*\*\* | 0.801\*\*\* |
|  | (21.93) | (17.54) | (0.038) | (0.039) |
| Income satisfaction (ref.: living comfortably) | | | |  |
| Coping | 0.106\*\*\* | 0.0958\*\*\* | 0.242\*\*\* | 0.260\*\*\* |
|  | (8.01) | (7.93) | (0.029) | (0.029) |
| Difficult | 0.177\*\*\* | 0.178\*\*\* | 0.465\*\*\* | 0.493\*\*\* |
|  | (9.10) | (10.09) | (0.042) | (0.043) |
| Very difficult | 0.349\*\*\* | 0.311\*\*\* | 0.973\*\*\* | 0.836\*\*\* |
|  | (10.53) | (10.32) | (0.075) | (0.074) |
|  |  |  |  |  |
| Constant | 2.015\*\*\* | 1.910\*\*\* |  |  |
|  | (19.28) | (16.16) |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
| Cutpoint1 |  |  | -0.948\*\*\* | -0.638\* |
|  |  |  | (0.239) | (0.303) |
| Cutpoint2 |  |  | 1.360\*\*\* | 1.958\*\*\* |
|  |  |  | (0.240) | (0.303) |
| Cutpoint3 |  |  | 3.130\*\*\* | 4.025\*\*\* |
|  |  |  | (0.240) | (0.304) |
| *Variance components* | |  |  |  |
| Constant | 0.02\*\*\* | 0.014\*\*\* | 0.077\*\* | 0.13\*\* |
|  | (0.007) | (0.005) | (0.026) | (0.043) |
| Residual | 0.528\*\*\* | 0.64\*\*\* |  |  |
|  | (0.005) | (0.006) |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
| *Statistics* |  |  |  |  |
| AIC | 50444.2 | 46417.9 | 56011.5 | 52697.4 |
| BIC | 50627.2 | 46600.8 | 56206.1 | 52892.0 |
| N (countries) | 16 | 16 | 19 | 19 |
| N (respondents) | 21053 | 21053 | 24529 | 24529 |

p < 0.05. \*\* p < 0.01. \*\*\*p < 0.001 (two-sided tests). All continuous variables standardized to range from 0 to 1