WEB APPENDIX W1 CREDIT CARD REPAYMENT STIMULI EXAMPLES

W1A. Study 1

Open Choice Format

Credit Card Statement Account Number 4321 5678 9012 3456 Statement Balance: \$1,949.28 Annual Percentage Rate (APR): 14.0% Minimum Required Amount: \$48.56 How much will you pay (in dollars)? \$_____

Active Choice Format

Account Number 4321 5678 9012 3456 Statement Balance: \$1,949.28 Annual Percentage Rate (APR): 14.0% Minimum Required Amount: \$48.56 Which payment option will you choose? Pay \$48.56 Pay \$1,949.28 Pay other amount (please indicate a number below) \$_____

WEB APPENDIX W1 (CONT'D) CREDIT CARD REPAYMENT STIMULI EXAMPLES

W1B. Study 2

Open Choice Format, without Current Balance, with MPW

Credit Card Payment Information											
<u>Account Number</u> 4321 5678 9876 5432											
Statement Balance (as of 4/24/2017): \$1,678.32 Minimum Payment Due: \$34.00											
* Annual Percentage Rate (APR): 16.0% Additional Information:											
If you make no additional charges using this card and each month you pay	additional charges using this card and balance shown on this paying an estimated										
the minimum required amount	17 years	\$4,029									
\$58	3 years	\$2,124									
How much will you pay (in do	llars)?										

Active Choice Format, with Current Balance, without MPW

Credit Card Payment Information	
Account Number 4321 5678 9876 5432	
Statement Balance (as of 4/24/2017): Current Balance: Minimum Payment Due:	\$1,678.32 \$2,457.19 \$34.00
* Annual Percentage Rate (APR): 16.0%	
Which payment option will you choose?	
\$1,678.32 Statement balance (as of 4/24/17)	
\$2,457.19 Current balance	
\$34.00 Minimum payment due	
Other amount (\$)	
I	

WEB APPENDIX W1 (CONT'D) CREDIT CARD REPAYMENT STIMULI EXAMPLES

W1C. Study 3

Open Choice, no MPW Table

Credit Card Payment Information		С	redit Card Payment	Information	
<u>Account Number</u> 4321 5678 9876 5432		<u>A</u>	ccount Number 321 5678 9876 5432		
Statement Balance (as of 11/22/17): Current Balance: Minimum Payment Due: * Annual Percentage Rate (APR): 16.0%	\$1,678.32 \$2,457.19 \$34.00	C M	tatement Balance (as of urrent Balance: linimum Payment Due: Annual Percentage Rate (dditional Information:	,	\$1,678.32 \$2,457.19 \$34.00
How much will you pay (in dollars)?			If you make no additional charges using this card and each month you pay	You will pay off the balance shown on this statement in about	And you will end up paying an estimated total of
			Only the minimum required amount	17 years	\$4,029
			\$58	3 years	\$2,124 (Savings=\$1,905)
		(\$1,678.32 Stateme \$2,457.19 Current \$34.00 Minimum p Other amount (\$)	nt balance (as of 11/2 balance	22/17)

Active choice with 3-Yr Amount, with MPW Table

<u>Account Number</u> 4321 5678 9876 5432									
Statement Balance (as of 11/22/17): \$1,678.32 Current Balance: \$2,457.19 Minimum Payment Due: \$34.00									
nnual Percentage Rate (APR): 16.0%								
ditional Information:									
If you make no additional charges using this card and each month you pay	You will pay off the balance shown on this statement in about	And you will end up paying an estimated total of							
Only the minimum required amount	17 years	\$4,029							
\$58	3 years	\$2,124 (Savings=\$1,905)							
	nt balance (as of 11/2	22/17)							
\$2,457.19 Current balance									
\$34.00 Minimum payment									
○ \$34.00 Minimum payment ○ \$58.00 Payment amount									

Enhanced active choice with 3-Yr Amount, no MPW Table

Active choice without 3-Yr Amount, with MPW Table

Credit Card Payment Information	
Account Number 4321 5678 9876 5432	
Statement Balance (as of 11/22/17): Current Balance: Minimum Payment Due: * Annual Percentage Rate (APR): 16.0%	\$1,678.32 \$2,457.19 \$34.00
Which payment option will you choose?	
\$1,678.32 Statement balance (as of 11/2: \$2,457.19 Current balance \$34.00 Minimum payment If you make no additional charges using this card an required amount, you will pay off the statement balar paying an estimated total of \$4,029. \$58.00 Payment amount If you make no additional charges using this card an the statement balance in about 3 years, and you will (saving \$1,905 compared with paying the minimum).	d each month you pay only the minimum nce in about 17 years, and you will end up d each month you pay \$58, you will pay off end up paying an estimated total of \$2,124
O Other amount (\$)	

WEB APPENDIX W2 FINANCIAL VULNERABILITY SCALE (STUDIES 2 AND 3)

Participants answered "Yes" or "No" to the following ten questions (Anderloni, Bacchiocchi and Vandone 2012). Each participant received one point for every "Yes" answer, and zero points for every "No" answer, yielding a total financial vulnerability score ranging from 0-10 points.

Over the past twelve months, has your household had problems even once:

- **1.** Paying for groceries;
- **2.** Paying for essential clothing;
- **3.** Paying utilities (heat, electricity, phone bill, etc.);
- **4.** Paying for housing (rent, mortgage, or condo fees for your home);
- 5. Paying credit card bills;
- **6.** Making loan payments other than credit cards or mortgage.

Over the past twelve months, have you gotten behind in paying:

- 1. Utilities (heat, electricity, phone bill, etc.);
- 2. Housing (rent, mortgage, or condo fees for your home);
- 3. Credit card bills;
- **4.** Loan payments other than credit cards or mortgage.

WEB APPENDIX W3: MPW DISCLOSURE COMPREHENSION

W3A. Measures Used in Study 2 and Study 3 Post-Test

Comprehend statement information (2-item scale; Study 2 $\alpha = 0.87$, Study 3 $\alpha = 0.86$):

- To what extent do you understand the information on the credit card statement? (1=Not at all/7=Very much)
- To what extent do you find the information on the credit card statement clear? (1=Not at all/7=Very clear)

Difficult to understand statement (3-item scale; Studies 2 and 3 $\alpha = 0.83$):

- To what extent do you find the information on the credit card statement confusing? (1=Not at all/7=Very confusing)
- How easy or difficult do you think the credit card statement is to read overall? (1=Very easy/7=Very difficult)
- How easy or difficult is it to make comparisons between different payment options for this credit card? (1=Very easy/7=Very difficult)

Understand specific information in the statement (1=Not at all/7=Very well):

- How well do you understand what the \$58 payment amount means?
- How well do you understand the Additional Information table?
- How well do you understand what the \$1,905 savings means?

Rank total cost (principle + interest) to pay off current balance:

Suppose your current balance today is \$2,457.19, and you do not make any new purchases with this credit card after today. Consider the following payment amounts shown below. Please rank order the payment options in terms of the **total cost** (**principal** + **interest**) **you would incur over time** until the total balance of \$2,457.19 is **paid off**, where "1" is the lowest total cost and "4" is the highest total cost:

Pay the statement balance this and every month		
Pay \$2,457.19 current balance this month		
Pay minimum required amount this and every month		
Pay \$58.00 amount this and every month		

Rank total time to pay off current balance:

Suppose your current balance today is \$2,457.19, and you do not make any new purchases with this credit card after today. Consider the following payment amounts shown below. Please rank order the payment options in terms of the **total time it would take to pay off** the total balance of \$2,457.19, where "1" is the shortest total time and "4" is the longest total time:

	1	2	3	4
Pay the statement balance this and every month				
Pay \$2,457.19 current balance this month				
Pay minimum required amount this and every month				
Pay \$58 amount this and every month				

WEB APPENDIX W3: MPW DISCLOSURE COMPREHENSION (CONT'D)

W3B. Study 2 Payment Information Comprehension Post-Test

Mean Values								Proport	tions	
									Cost	Time
		Current						_	Rank	Rank
Choice	MPW	Balance		Comprehe			MPW	Cost	Correct	Correct
Format	Present	Present	N	Overal	l Overal	l Amount	Table	Savings	(3-tier)	(4-tier)
Open	No	No	68	6.16	2.78				64.7%	52.9%
Open	MPW	No	64	6.08	2.52	6.02	6.02	6.23	60.9%	43.8%
Open	No	Yes	66	6.05	2.82				65.2%	71.2%
Open	MPW	Yes	67	5.81	3.02	6.13	5.73	5.97	67.2%	68.7%
Active	No	No	68	6.30	2.25				55.8%	50.0%
Active	MPW	No	65	6.39	2.21	6.15	6.28	6.17	67.7%	58.5%
Active	No	Yes	64	6.24	2.29				71.9%	71.9%
Active	MPW	Yes	69	6.12	2.33	6.20	6.07	6.30	68.1%	72.5%
All			531	6.14	2.53	6.13	6.02	6.17	65.2%	61.2%
Regressi	on/Logit	Variables		Coeff (p)	Coeff (p)	Coeff (p)	Coeff (p)	Coeff (p)	Coeff (p)	Coeff (p)
Active c	hoice for	mat (ACF) (0.23 (.008)	-0.50 (.000)	0.11 (.506)	0.32 (.046)	0.15 (.289)	0.02 (.939)	0.13 (.514)
Current		`	/	0.17 (.051)	0.14 (.253)	0.09 (.599)	-0.27 (.096)	-0.10 (.509)	0.35 (.097)	0.94 (.000)
		ig (MPW)		0.10 (.263)	-0.02 (.846)	,	,	` ,	0.12 (.566)	0.07 (.738)
	Financial vulnerability (FV)) -(0.17 (.089)	0.47 (.001)	-0.10 (.584)	-0.19 (.284)	-0.17 (.281)	-0.58 (.012)	-0.69 (.001)
MPW x	ACF		(0.14 (.411)	0.01 (.980)				0.36 (.391)	0.50 (.203)
CB x AC	CF		-(0.03 (.873)	-0.13 (.607)	-0.16 (.630)	-0.03 (.927)	0.29 (.311)	-0.06 (.893)	-0.26 (.510)
MPW x	CB		-(0.16 (.350)	0.37 (.135)				-0.49 (.238)	-0.07 (.864)
ACF x F	V		-(0.15 (.409)	0.17 (.495)	-0.29 (.402)	-0.47 (.147)	-0.40 (.167)	-0.05 (.906)	-0.02 (.951)
CB x FV			(0.23 (.196)	-0.43 (.081)	-0.01 (.970)	0.08 (.808)	-0.01 (.976)	-0.92 (.034)	-0.81 (.045)
MPW x				0.32 (.066)	0.18 (.459)				0.00 (.997)	-0.28 (.487)
MPW x	ACF x C	B		0.12 (.733)	-0.34 (.482)				-1.23 (.141)	-0.62 (.426)
MPW x		V		0.58 (.100)	-0.44 (.372)				0.51 (.548)	0.26 (.742)
CB x AC				0.22 (.527)	-0.55 (.261)	-0.66 (.334)	-0.17 (.797)	0.59 (.315)	0.78 (.360)	1.25 (.116)
MPW x				0.31 (.387)	-0.23 (.647)				0.30 (.727)	-1.13 (.158)
MPW x	ACF x C	B x FV	(0.31 (.658)	0.21 (.834)				1.15 (.504)	0.08 (.959)
Income			(0.02 (.846)	-0.02 (.893)	0.28 (.153)	0.13 (.479)	0.14 (.400)	-0.12 (.628)	-0.39 (.079)
Age				0.28 (.002)	-0.29 (.022)	0.25 (.123)	0.17 (.264)	0.05 (.717)	0.41 (.063)	-0.18 (.364)
Education				0.00 (.981)	0.38 (.004)	-0.39 (.050)	-0.36 (.060)	0.07 (.690)	0.21 (.336)	0.10 (.626)
Gender (0.04 (.662)	-0.27 (.035)	0.22 (.209)	0.32 (.055)	0.25 (.093)	0.76 (.000)	0.52 (.007)
Ethnic m				0.04 (.690)	0.24 (.099)	0.17 (.380)	0.19 (.303)	0.08 (.649)	-0.73 (.001)	-0.26 (.236)
Number		cards		0.30 (.001)	-0.23 (.072)	0.35 (.018)	0.28 (.049)	0.33 (.010)	0.38 (.124)	0.48 (.037)
Knowled	_			0.19 (.043)	-0.42 (.001)	0.29 (.109)	0.60 (.000)	0.56 (.000)	1.61 (.000)	0.66 (.001)
Intercept	t		(5.14 (.000)	2.54 (.000)	6.12 (.000)	6.03 (.000)	6.17 (.000)	0.80 (.000)	0.53 (.000)

Notes: Correct total cost rank, in descending order, is (3 tiers): current balance and statement balance (in either order), 3-year amount, minimum required amount. Correct payoff time rank, in ascending order, is (4 tiers): current balance, statement balance, 3-year amount, and minimum required amount. We use the Firth estimation method for the cost and time ranking accuracy binary logistic regressions reported in Study 2 and Study 3 post-tests due to quasi-complete separation present in our outcome variable data (Firth 1993, Heinze and Schemper 2002).

WEB APPENDIX W3: MPW DISCLOSURE COMPREHENSION (CONT'D)

W3C. Study 3 Payment Information Comprehension Post-Test

	Propo	ortions							
								Cost	Time
Chaire France	MPW		O 1	1 D:cc:1	. 2 W	MDW	C	Rank	Rank
Choice Format	Table Present	N	Comprer Overa	nend Difficul ll Overall		MPW Table	Cost Savings	Correct (3-tier)	Correct (4-tier)
					Amount	Table	Savings	` '	
Open	No	57	5.86	3.05	< 21	c 12	7 .06	69.5%	68.4%
Open	MPW	55 55	5.95	2.85	6.31	6.13	5.96	75.4%	74.5%
Active, no 3-Yr Active, no 3-Yr	No MPW	55 57	6.11 5.86	2.36 2.88	6.51	6.18	6.25	80.0% 71.2%	70.9% 68.4%
Active, 3-Yr	No	58	5.93	3.17	3.53	0.16	0.23	75.9%	69.0%
Active, 3-Yr	MPW	58	5.99	2.82	6.14	6.07	5.88	78.0%	77.6%
Enhan. active, 3-Yr	No	58	6.19	2.21	6.14	0.07	6.29	77.6%	82.8%
Enhan. active, 3-Yr	MPW	57	5.96	2.60	6.28	6.05	5.98	77.2%	78.9%
All		455	5.98	2.74	5.81	6.11	6.07	75.5%	73.8%
Regression/Logit Va	riables	C	peff (p)	Coeff (p)	Coeff (p)	Coeff (p)	Coeff (p)	Coeff (p)	Coeff (p)
Active, no 3-Yr (AC	F)	0.1	1 (.469)	-0.27 (.166)	0.19 (.491)	0.04 (.858)	0.25 (.341)	-0.02 (.966)	-0.15 (.668)
Active with 3-Yr (A			1 (.459)	-0.05 (.786)	-1.34 (.000)	-0.02 (.943)	-0.05 (.844)	0.29 (.397)	0.06 (.858)
Enhan. active, 3-Yr	(ACF3e)	0.2	3 (.120)	-0.54 (.006)	-0.03 (.916)	-0.04 (.877)	0.07 (.801)	0.21 (.545)	0.60 (.087)
Min. pmt. warning (l	MPW)	-0.0	9 (.368)	0.10 (.454)	0.77 (.000)		-0.28 (.275)	-0.15 (.556)	-0.02 (.947)
Financial vulnerabili	ty (FV)	-0.0	9 (.412)	0.35 (.017)	0.22 (.301)	-0.14 (.406)	-0.04 (.871)	-0.36 (.190)	-0.36 (.166)
MPW x ACF		-0.4	1 (.162)	0.75 (.054)				-1.50 (.048)	-0.54 (.427)
MPW x ACF3			2 (.678)	0.11 (.774)	2.40 (.000)			-0.78 (.266)	0.08 (.896)
MPW x ACF3e		-0.3	7 (.208)	0.66 (.088)				-0.75 (.281)	-0.34 (.632)
MPW x FV		-0.3	2 (.123)	0.15 (.593)	0.11 (.789)		-0.24 (.638)	0.71 (.174)	1.63 (.001)
ACF x FV			3 (.073)	0.42 (.281)	0.25 (.644)	-0.03 (.939)	0.19 (.720)	-0.79 (.303)	-0.79 (.252)
ACF3 x FV			3 (.260)	0.26 (.504)	0.81 (.133)	-0.64 (.160)	-0.30 (.568)	-0.26 (.709)	0.11 (.864)
ACF3e x FV		0.0	2 (.946)	0.37 (.342)	0.06 (.918)	-0.07 (.881)	-0.10 (.850)	0.03 (.970)	0.72 (.303)
MPW x ACF x FV		-0.1	5 (.797)	0.95 (.222)				2.32 (.135)	-0.90 (.514)
MPW x ACF3 x FV			3 (.465)	1.91 (.014)	-1.08 (.152)			-0.07 (.958)	-2.64 (.042)
MPW x ACF3e x FV	1	-0.6	3 (.276)	0.45 (.557)				2.85 (.042)	0.74 (.597)
Income		0.0	6 (.615)	0.04 (.809)	0.09 (.577)	-0.00 (.999)	-0.01 (.966)	-0.22 (.435)	-0.34 (.178)
Age			2 (.841)	-0.12 (.396)	-0.03 (.844)	-0.19 (.234)	-0.09 (.577)	0.37 (.188)	-0.38 (.119)
Education		0.0	6 (.583)	0.30 (.041)	-0.06 (.704)	0.03 (.869)	-0.09 (.604)	0.52 (.049)	0.25 (.318)
Gender $(1 = female)$			4 (.686)	-0.55 (.000)	-0.07 (.667)	0.17 (.318)	-0.05 (.781)	1.22 (.000)	0.84 (.001)
Ethnic minority (0-1			4 (.036)	0.61 (.000)	0.25 (.158)	-0.19 (.311)	-0.06 (.763)	-1.04 (.000)	-0.61 (.015)
Number of credit car	rds		5 (.000)	-0.14 (.330)	0.26 (.184)	0.47 (.021)	0.43 (.037)	0.42 (.079)	0.17 (.454)
Knowledge			1 (.053)	-0.40 (.006)	0.07 (.662)	0.25 (.167)	0.39 (.028)	1.50 (.000)	1.37 (.000)
Intercept		5.9	9 (.000)	2.73 (.000)	5.93 (.000)	6.12 (.000)	6.16 (.000)	1.44 (.000)	1.23 (.000)

Notes: 'ACF' = Active format with no 3-year payoff option. 'ACF3' = Active format with 3-year payoff option. 'ACF3e' = Enhanced active format with 3-year payoff option.

WEB APPENDIX W4 PROJECTED LONG TERM DEBT BY EXPERIMENTAL CONDITION

W4A. Study 1

Choice Format	N	Percent Minimum Required	Percent Statement Balance	Average Payment Amount	Average Months to Pay Off	Average Total Interest	Total Long-term Debt
Open	100	8.0%	25.0%	\$629.67	30.8	\$348.63	\$2,297.91
Active	109	20.2%	43.1%	\$928.80	36.7	\$374.07	\$2,323.35

W4B. Study 2

				Percent	Percent		Average		Total
Choice Format	MPW Table Present	Current Balance Present	N	Minimum Required	3-Year Amount	Average Payment Amount	Months to Pay Off	Average Total Interest	Long-term Debt
Open	No	No	82	14.6%	.0%	\$547.95	45.7	\$538.35	\$2,216.67
Open	MPW	No	79	6.3%	29.1%	\$411.91	35.1	\$418.30	\$2,096.62
Open	No	Yes	80	17.5%	.0%	\$660.28	47.6	\$553.89	\$2,232.21
Open	MPW	Yes	79	5.1%	17.7%	\$574.31	29.2	\$347.62	\$2,025.94
Active	No	No	79	34.2%	.0%	\$592.21	78.3	\$906.41	\$2,584.73
Active	MPW	No	83	18.1%	12.0%	\$717.42	48.1	\$558.11	\$2,236.43
Active	No	Yes	79	16.5%	.0%	\$1,126.63	40.8	\$468.67	\$2,146.99
Active	MPW	Yes	78	10.3%	11.5%	\$1,174.58	31.3	\$362.56	\$2,040.88

W4C. Study 3

	MPW		Percent	Percent				
Choice	Table		Minimum	3-Year	Average Payment	Average Months	Average Total	Total Long-term
Format	Present	N	Required	Amount	Amount	to Pay Off	Interest	Debt
Open	No	104	22.1%	0%	\$654.93	58.4	\$679.17	\$2,357.49
Open	MPW	101	8.9%	20.8%	\$538.72	38.8	\$460.98	\$2,139.30
Active, no 3-Yr	No	101	25.7%	0%	\$801.41	60.9	\$702.20	\$2,380.52

Active, no 3-Yr	MPW	102	11.8%	11.8%	\$1,036.49	36.5	\$423.52	\$2,101.84
Active, 3-Yr	No	102	16.7%	15.7%	\$886.65	44.4	\$513.86	\$2,192.18
Active, 3-Yr	MPW	101	6.9%	35.6%	\$760.33	33.0	\$392.41	\$2,070.73
Enhanced active, 3-Yr	No	101	7.9%	24.8%	\$1,103.19	28.9	\$335.46	\$2,013.78
Enhanced active, 3-Yr	MPW	105	5.7%	38.1%	\$866.05	28.9	\$340.76	\$2,019.08

Notes: Projected payoff months and interest cost amounts are estimated for each individual participant and then averaged across participants within each condition. Estimates assume payment amount choices are repeated every month until the statement balance is paid. Study 1 minimum payments are assumed to be 2.5% of the balance due each month or \$15, whichever is greater (14% APR). Studies 2 and 3 minimum payments are assumed to be 2% of the balance due each month or \$15, whichever is greater (16% APR). The pattern of results remains unchanged if we instead estimate cost and time to pay off the current balance in Study 3. Overall, the distribution of payment amounts in each condition is more indicative of aggregate long term debt costs than is the average monthly payment amount.