**Online Appendix**

*Table 3 Summary statistics of major variables*

|  |
| --- |
|  |
| **Statistic** | **N** | **Mean** | **St. Dev.** | **Min** | **Max** |
| *Case Acceptance* | 1,059 | 0.734 | 0.442 | 0 | 1 |
| *Ideological Unity* | 1,061 | 0.787 | 0.098 | 0.452 | 0.974 |
| *Government Party* | 1,064 | 0.540 | 0.499 | 0 | 1 |
| *Government Loss (t-1)* | 1,064 | 0.034 | 0.181 | 0 | 1 |
| *Vote Loss* | 1,064 | 1.525 | 2.076 | 0.000 | 11.200 |
| *Electoral Proximity* | 1,061 | 7.339 | 4.166 | 0.090 | 14.610 |
| *Appeal* | 1,062 | 0.771 | 0.420 | 0 | 1 |
| *Subject Matter* | 1,050 | 0.624 | 0.485 | 0 | 1 |
| *Left-Right* | 1,062 | -3.645 | 18.868 | -34.573 | 29.927 |
| *Initiator* | 1,061 | 0.341 | 0.474 | 0 | 1 |
| *Party Age (log)* | 1,064 | 3.778 | 0.983 | 0.000 | 4.949 |
| *Membership Size (log)* | 1,064 | 12.649 | 1.145 | 9.929 | 13.837 |
|  |

*Table 4 Logit Model without random effects*

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **DV: Case accepted** | **(1)** | **(2)** | **(3)** | **(4)** | **(5)** |
| *Ideological Unity* |  | -2.252\*\* (1.076) |  |  | -2.207\*\*(1.092) |
| *Government Party* |  |  | 0.154(0.170) |  | 0.162(0.182) |
| *Government Loss (t-1)* |  |  | 2.289\*\*(1.027) |  | 2.115\*\*(1.033) |
| *Vote Loss* |  |  |  | 0.100\*\*(0.041) | 0.116\*\*\* (0.043) |
| *Electoral Proximity* |  |  |  | 0.037\*\*(0.018) | 0.030\*(0.018) |
| *Appeal* | 0.910\*\*\*(0.181) | 0.858\*\*\* (0.183) | 0.873\*\*\* (0.181) | 0.854\*\*\* (0.183) | 0.748\*\*\* (0.187) |
| *Subject Matter* | -0.513\*\*\*(0.166) | -0.516\*\*\* (0.167) | -0.532\*\*\* (0.167) | -0.521\*\*\* (0.168) | -0.548\*\*\* (0.168) |
| *Initiator* | 0.245(0.165) | 0.228(0.165) | 0.245(0.165) | 0.271(0.167) | 0.259(0.167) |
| *Left-Right* | 0.014\*\*\*(0.004) | 0.010\*\*(0.004) | 0.013\*\*\* (0.004) | 0.014\*\*\* (0.004) | 0.010\*\*(0.005) |
| *Party Age (log)* | 0.225\*\*(0.113) | 0.131(0.121) | 0.169(0.118) | 0.151(0.116) | -0.008(0.131) |
| *Membership Size (log)* | -0.538\*\*\*(0.106) | -0.451\*\*\* (0.112) | -0.518\*\*\* (0.107) | -0.522\*\*\* (0.106) | -0.408\*\*\* (0.116) |
| *Constant* | 6.659\*\*\* (1.074) | 7.743\*\*\* (1.244) | 6.529\*\*\* (1.087) | 6.372\*\*\* (1.075) | 7.272\*\*\* (1.225) |
| *Observations* | 1,045 | 1,044 | 1,045 | 1,044 | 1,044 |
| *Log Likelihood* | -565.814 | -562.326 | -560.697 | -559.115 | -552.315 |
| *AIC* | 1,145.628 | 1,140.653 | 1,139.395 | 1,136.230 | 1,128.629 |
| \*p<0.1; \*\*p<0.05; \*\*\*p<0.01; Party-clustered standard errors in parentheses. |

*Table 5 Hierarchical Logit Model with both Economic Left-Right and Open-Close ideological variables*

|  |
| --- |
|  |
| **DV: Case accepted** | **(2a)** | **(2b)** | **(3)** | **(4)** | **(5a)** | **(5b)** |
| *Policy Agreement* | -1.996\* (1.097) | -2.252\*\* (1.076) |  |  | -1.992\* (1.099) | -2.207\*\* (1.092) |
| *Ideology (Open-Closed)* | 0.008(0.008) |  |  |  | 0.012(0.008) |  |
| *Government Party* |  |  | 0.154(0.170) |  | 0.094(0.188) | 0.162(0.182) |
| *Government Loss (t-1)* |  |  | 2.289\*\* (1.027) |  | 2.006\* (1.037) | 2.115\*\* (1.033) |
| *Vote Loss* |  |  |  | 0.100\*\* (0.041) | 0.129\*\*\* (0.044) | 0.116\*\*\* (0.043) |
| *Electoral Proximity* |  |  |  | 0.037\*\* (0.018) | 0.032\* (0.018) | 0.030\* (0.018) |
| *Appeal* | 0.864\*\*\* (0.183) | 0.858\*\*\* (0.183) | 0.873\*\*\* (0.181) | 0.854\*\*\* (0.183) | 0.743\*\*\* (0.187) | 0.748\*\*\* (0.187) |
| *Subject Matter* | -0.510\*\*\* (0.167) | -0.516\*\*\* (0.167) | -0.532\*\*\* (0.167) | -0.521\*\*\* (0.168) | -0.542\*\*\* (0.169) | -0.548\*\*\* (0.168) |
| *Initiator* | 0.227(0.165) | 0.228(0.165) | 0.245(0.165) | 0.271(0.167) | 0.258(0.168) | 0.259(0.167) |
| *Ideology (Left-Right)* | 0.006(0.006) | 0.010\*\* (0.004) | 0.013\*\*\* (0.004) | 0.014\*\*\* (0.004) | 0.005(0.006) | 0.010\*\* (0.005) |
| *Party Age (log)* | 0.131(0.121) | 0.131(0.121) | 0.169(0.118) | 0.151(0.116) | -0.013 (0.131) | -0.008(0.131) |
| *Membership Size (log)* | -0.506\*\*\* (0.123) | -0.451\*\*\* (0.112) | -0.518\*\*\* (0.107) | -0.522\*\*\* (0.106) | -0.473\*\*\* (0.125) | -0.408\*\*\* (0.116) |
| *Constant* | 8.315\*\*\* (1.351) | 7.743\*\*\* (1.244) | 6.529\*\*\* (1.087) | 6.372\*\*\* (1.075) | 8.082\*\*\* (1.345) | 7.272\*\*\* (1.225) |
| *Variance (Party RE)* |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| *Observations* | 1,044 | 1,044 | 1,045 | 1,044 | 1,044 | 1,044 |
| *Log Likelihood* | -561.739 | -562.326 | -560.697 | -559.115 | -551.252 | -552.315 |
| *AIC* | 1,143.478 | 1,142.653 | 1,141.395 | 1,138.230 | 1,130.505 | 1,130.629 |
| \*p<0.1; \*\*p<0.05; \*\*\*p<0.01; Standard errors in parentheses. |

*Figure 3: Correlation Plot of Main Variables*



*Table 6: Fixed Effects Logit Models of Case Acceptance (Rejection) by German Party Tribunals, 1967-2015.*

|  |
| --- |
|  |
|  | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) |
|  |
| *Vote Loss* |  | 0.093\*\* (0.042) |  |  | 0.114\*\*\* (0.043) |
| *Electoral Proximity* |  | 0.035\* (0.018) |  |  | 0.026 (0.018) |
| *Policy Agreement* |  |  | -3.474\*\* (1.407) |  | -3.327\*\* (1.416) |
| *Government Party* |  |  |  | 0.149 (0.176) | 0.130 (0.186) |
| *Government Loss (t-1)* |  |  |  | 2.269\*\* (1.033) | 2.128\*\* (1.043) |
| *Appeal* | 0.809\*\*\* (0.199) | 0.789\*\*\* (0.201) | 0.805\*\*\* (0.200) | 0.786\*\*\* (0.200) | 0.754\*\*\* (0.203) |
| *Subject Matter* | -0.537\*\*\* (0.169) | -0.536\*\*\* (0.170) | -0.538\*\*\* (0.169) | -0.546\*\*\* (0.169) | -0.547\*\*\* (0.171) |
| *Initiator* | 0.222 (0.169) | 0.249 (0.171) | 0.207 (0.170) | 0.209 (0.170) | 0.227 (0.172) |
| *Ideology (Left-Right)* | 0.010 (0.007) | 0.010 (0.007) | 0.001 (0.008) | 0.010 (0.008) | 0.003 (0.008) |
| *Party Age (log)* | -0.093 (0.281) | -0.157 (0.281) | -0.331 (0.310) | -0.166 (0.287) | -0.450 (0.313) |
| *Membership Size (log)* | -0.900\*\* (0.417) | -0.728\* (0.428) | -0.685 (0.425) | -0.718 (0.443) | -0.250 (0.465) |
| *CSU* | -0.760 (0.626) | -0.438 (0.645) | -0.454 (0.639) | -0.520 (0.653) | 0.231 (0.690) |
| *FDP* | -0.628 (0.962) | -0.223 (0.982) | -0.798 (0.977) | -0.216 (1.021) | 0.189 (1.042) |
| *Greens* | -1.257 (1.228) | -0.860 (1.241) | -0.916 (1.255) | -0.761 (1.299) | 0.164 (1.326) |
| *SPD* | 0.223 (0.446) | 0.214 (0.449) | 0.176 (0.453) | 0.273 (0.453) | 0.165 (0.460) |
| *Linke* | -1.919 (1.247) | -1.471 (1.259) | -2.148\* (1.299) | -1.500 (1.306) | -1.058 (1.345) |
| *Constant* | 12.907\*\* (5.857) | 10.445\* (5.986) | 13.817\*\* (6.013) | 10.629\* (6.218) | 7.868 (6.393) |
|  |
| *N* | 1,045 | 1,044 | 1,044 | 1,045 | 1,044 |
| *Log Likelihood* | -563.358 | -557.455 | -558.767 | -558.528 | -549.874 |
| *AIC* | 1,150.716 | 1,142.911 | 1,143.535 | 1,145.056 | 1,133.749 |
|  |
|  | \*p<0.1; \*\*p<0.05; \*\*\*p<0.01Standard errors in parentheses. |

*Table 7: Hierarchical Logit Models of Case Acceptance (Rejection) by German Party Tribunals, 1967-2015, and interactions with subject matter.*

|  |
| --- |
|  |
|  | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) |
|  |
| *Vote Loss* |  | 0.082 (0.065) |  |  | 0.106 (0.067) |
| *Vote Loss X Subject* |  | 0.026 (0.081) |  |  | 0.017 (0.083) |
| *Electoral Proximity* |  | 0.051 (0.033) |  |  | 0.045 (0.033) |
| *Days to Elec. X Subject* |  | -0.020 (0.039) |  |  | -0.020 (0.039) |
| *Policy Agreement* |  |  | -0.515 (1.831) |  | -0.371 (1.816) |
| *Policy Agree. X Subject* |  |  | -2.374 (2.074) |  | -2.487 (2.070) |
| *Government Party* |  |  |  | 0.277 (0.272) | 0.384 (0.290) |
| *Gov. Party X Subject* |  |  |  | -0.187 (0.317) | -0.319 (0.335) |
| *Government Loss (t-1)* |  |  |  | 0.820 (1.081) | 0.759 (1.098) |
| *Gov. Loss X Subject* |  |  |  | 15.533 (1,291.270) | 15.329 (1,264.919) |
| *Appeal* | 0.910\*\*\* (0.181) | 0.853\*\*\* (0.183) | 0.858\*\*\* (0.183) | 0.871\*\*\* (0.182) | 0.746\*\*\* (0.188) |
| *Subject Matter* | -0.513\*\*\* (0.166) | -0.412 (0.336) | 1.397 (1.675) | -0.444\* (0.245) | 1.741 (1.738) |
| *Initiator* | 0.245 (0.165) | 0.269 (0.167) | 0.232 (0.165) | 0.245 (0.165) | 0.264 (0.168) |
| *Ideology (Left Right)* | 0.014\*\*\* (0.004) | 0.014\*\*\* (0.004) | 0.010\*\* (0.004) | 0.013\*\*\* (0.004) | 0.010\*\* (0.005) |
| *Party Age (log)* | 0.225\*\* (0.113) | 0.152 (0.116) | 0.126 (0.121) | 0.173 (0.118) | -0.009 (0.131) |
| *Membership Size (log)* | -0.538\*\*\* (0.106) | -0.521\*\*\* (0.106) | -0.449\*\*\* (0.112) | -0.519\*\*\* (0.107) | -0.409\*\*\* (0.117) |
| *Constant* | 6.659\*\*\* (1.074) | 6.283\*\*\* (1.098) | 6.336\*\*\* (1.705) | 6.471\*\*\* (1.095) | 5.594\*\*\* (1.695) |
|  |
| *N* | 1,045 | 1,044 | 1,044 | 1,045 | 1,044 |
| *Log Likelihood* | -565.814 | -558.937 | -561.689 | -559.030 | -549.662 |
| *AIC* | 1,147.628 | 1,141.874 | 1,143.378 | 1,142.061 | 1,135.324 |
|  |
| \*p<0.1; \*\*p<0.05; \*\*\*p<0.01Standard errors in parentheses. |