Key extracted data within narrative A: The experiences of family members witnessing the diminishing drinking of a dying relative

Acronyms used: Artificial nutrition and hydration (ANH). Clinically assisted hydration (CAH)

Citation and location	Aim	Care setting	Participants	Methodology	Data collection	Data analysis	Key relevant findings	Relevant recommendations
Meares 1997, USA ¹	To explore the meaning of gradual cessation of eating and drinking described by women caregivers.	Adult in- home hospice patients	12 women, bereaved family members and primary caregivers of cancer patients who had died at home	Phenomen- ology	Interviews	Line-by-line coding and thematic analysis	Seven key themes were identified. These were the meaning of food, caregiver as sustainer, current losses, personal responses, ceasing to be–starved to death, being bereaved–the meaning now and paradox.	Each situation needs individual assessment and clarification of the values of family members. Nurses may need to open discussions proactively and initiate them early. Further research might include consideration of ethical decision-making and diverse cultural and disease contexts.
McClement, Degner and Harlos 2004, Canada ²	To report on a sub- theme of wider research entitled 'fighting back: It's best to eat.	Specialist palliative care in- patient unit	13 adult in- patients, mostly with cancer, 13 family members, 10 bereaved family members, 11 professionals	Grounded theory	Participant observation and interviews	Grounded theory	The strategies family members used to encourage food and fluid intake were targeting the patient, food manipulation and the health care provider. Efforts to increase fluid intake comprised auditing care, blaming healthcare providers and petitioning for remedial intervention. These strategies can be emotionally difficult for professionals.	Healthcare providers need to anticipate, acknowledge and assess concerns and elicit the expectations of family members regarding care. More research needed for non-malignant groups.

Style Definition: references: Space Before: Auto, After: Auto, Line spacing: single

McClement, and Harlos 2008, Canada ³	To report on a sub- theme of wider research entitled 'letting nature take its course: it's best not to eat'.	Specialist palliative care in- patient unit	13 in-patients, mostly with cancer, 13 family members, 10 bereaved family members, 11 professionals	Grounded theory	Participant observation and interviews	Grounded theory	The strategies family members who accepted declining intake as a 'normal' part of dying involved 'finding other ways to care'. These included participating in physical care, being present and protecting.	More research needed to test the findings, explore the issue in differing cultural contexts and investigate complexities of nutritional care.
Yamagishi et al. 2010, Japan ⁴	To clarify the levels and determinants of family members' distress about patients' cessation of oral nourishment.	Bereaved relatives of cancer patients who had died in palliative care units	452 bereaved family members	Nationwide cross- sectional survey	Piloted questionnaire	Univariate and logistic regression analysis using SPSS	71% found a relative becoming unable to drink very distressing or distressing; 60% felt a need for much, some or considerable improvement in professional practice; 69% reported helplessness and guilt; 60% had believed dehydration causes distress and 58% believed CAH is a minimum standard of care. 68% perceived professionals paid enough attention to their concerns.	Health professionals should relieve family members' helplessness and guilt, provide appropriate information, understand family concerns and provide emotional support.
Raijmakers et al. 2013, New Zealand ⁵	To understand family members' concerns about decreasing oral intake of dying patients.	Specialist palliative care service including in- patient, community and hospital team	Bereaved relatives of people who had died under specialist palliative care service	Qualitative (cit)	One-to-one semi- structure interviews	Thematic analysis	Oral intake at end of life was meaningful for relatives due to its nutritional value, enjoyment, social function, daily rhythm and expression of caring and love. It was distressing when the intake of patients declined. Some viewed decreasing intake as	Healthcare professionals should be aware of broader meaning of declining intake to family members and that many aspects of the concerns of family members about decreasing intake cannot be addressed by artificial nutrition and

			a normal part of process of	nutrition (ANH).
			dying but others viewed it	Conversations with family
			as the patient's choice to	members are needed.
			'give up'. This left some	
			family members feeling	
			helpless and others relieved	
			of the imperative to feed.	
			Some felt caught in a vicious	
			circle in which both patient	
			and family did not want	
			each other to worry.	
			Participants recalled little	
			communication with health	
			professionals.	

Key extracted data within Narrative B: The experiences of family members regarding intervention for diminishing drinking and its consequences. (Family members' perspective)

Acronyms used: Artificial nutrition and hydration (ANH). Clinically assisted hydration (CAH)

Citation and	Aim	Care setting	Participants	Methodology	Data collection	Data	Key relevant findings	Relevant recommendations
location						analysis		
Musgrave,	To identify the	Adult	Convenience	Pilot survey	Structured	Responses	81% of families were	Wider research needed
Bartal and	attitudes of	oncology	sample of 33		interviews	categorised	positive towards	focusing on reasons for
Opstad	patients, doctors,	unit of a	patients, 32			as positive,	intravenous fluids for	starting fluids.
1996, Israel ⁶	nurses and family	hospital	family			negative or	administration of	
	members towards		members and			neutral and	medication, and symptom	
	intravenous fluids		35			statistically	control. Doctors usually	
	in dying patients		professionals			described	initiated decisions, with 13%	
	and their						involving family. Findings	
	involvement in						were considered contextual	
	decision-making.						to Israeli community.	

Parkash and Burge 1997, Canada ⁷	To describe the issues of family caregivers when making decisions regarding CAH for dying patients.	Home support and in-patient palliative care programme with a medical centre	7 family members: white, middle- class Canadian of British or Irish origin	Qualitative (cit)	Semi-structure interviews	Categorised under a priori themes	The factors influencing caregivers were concerns about symptom distress and positive and negative effects of rehydration on this, ethics, emotional considerations, information exchange, decision-making and culture. Caregivers' perceptions of the benefits of CAH are varied and are	More timely discussions about hydration issues to consider patients' wishes, to increase provision of information and to elicit concerns of family.
Morita, et al. 1999, Japan ⁸	To clarify patients' and family members' perceptions about CAH and identify factors in their decision-making about it.	In-patient hospice	62 hospice inpatients with cancer and 119 family members	Prospective survey	Structured interview Recording of potential contributing factors	Multiple logistic regression analysis	central to their decision-making. 85% of family members believed patient could not get appropriate nutrition without CAH. 56% believed that dehydration hastens death.	More research including development of a tool to assess family members' concerns.
Morita, T. et al. 2006, Japan ⁹	'To clarify knowledge and beliefs of a general population regarding CAH (and other aspects of end of life care).	General population and palliative care units	2548 general population subjects and 513 bereaved family members of people with cancer	Survey	Piloted questionnaire	Analysis of variance	33-50% of participants believed ANH should be continued as minimum standard until death and 15%-31% agreed ANH relieved patient symptoms. No significant differences between those recruited from palliative care units and others.	Good practice in palliative care should reduce inaccurate beliefs.

Rurup et al.	To investigate the	39 nursing	190 patients	Survey	Piloted	Descriptive	65% of family members	More open discussion of
2006,	attitudes of	homes	with advanced		questionnaire	statistical	agreed more than disagreed	likelihood of CAH
Netherlands	physicians, nurses		dementia, 75			analysis	or fully agreed that	influencing peaceful death.
10	and relatives		physicians,				decisions of patients who	Greater cognisance of
	towards medical		136 family				refuse to drink should be	different perspectives.
	decisions about		members, 178				respected. Family members	
	patients with		nurses				agreed with this more than	
	dementia at the						nurses or physicians,	
	end of life.						particularly if they thought	
							relative had more pain and	
							discomfort at time of	
							decision. Physicians are	
							more confident of peaceful	
							death in the absence of CAH	
							than either nurses or	
							families.	
Cohen et al.	To describe the	Hospice	85 cancer	Hermeneutic	Interviews on	Thematic	Two themes emerged: hope	Need for individualised care.
2012, USA ¹¹	meaning of CAH for	home care	patients, 84	phenomen-	day 1 and then	hermeneutic	 <u>f</u>luids were considered 	Recommends future
	terminally ill cancer		family	ology	4 of the trial	analysis	essential for survival,	research into meaning of
	patients and their		caregivers	David a Clause a			healing and staying healthy	dehydration and parenteral
	caregivers.			Part of larger			by family members; comfort	hydration and also consider
				randomised			 hydration was considered 	cultural and gender
				control trial			important for reducing pain,	preferences for it.
							enhancing medication	
							effectiveness, nourishing	
							body, mind and spirit, and	
							enhancing breathing and	
							quality of life.	

Torres-Vigil et al., 2012, Texas, USA ¹²	To identify whether patients with advanced cancer and their caregivers view CAH as food or medicine.	Hospice home care	54 cancer patients, 68 family caregivers	Optional and additional qualitative part of randomised control trial	Asked a single question during interview	Chi squared analysis for correlation using SPSS	38% of participants felt fluid was more like food, 34% felt it was more like medicine and 14% as both. Ethnic minority participants more likely to view fluid as food (66%) compared with white participants (42%) but no other significant differences.	Professionals need to ask patients and caregivers about their perceptions to enhance communication and culturally appropriate care.
Bükki et al. 2014, Germany ¹³	To evaluate the needs, concerns, preferences and experiences of patients and caregivers regarding decisions about ANH at end of life.	Hospital wards providing cancer care	39 patients and 30 caregivers	Prospective, cross- sectional survey	Modified questionnaire	Descriptive statistics and correlation between ordinal variables assessed using SPSS.	Family members were more positive about assisted fluids and nutrition than patients when deciding on behalf of patients. No association with religiosity but advancing age was a factor in desire to forgo ANH in family and patients. Information did not change decision but did change confidence of relatives. Family concerned about pain, thirst and agitation. Family preferred detailed information from doctors; moderate satisfaction with current communication.	Early discussions focusing on addressing concerns. Research about crosscultural differences. Assessments of level of knowledge of non-malignant groups.

Studies within Narrative B: The experiences of family members regarding intervention for diminishing drinking and its consequences. (Professionals' perspective)

Acronyms used: Artificial nutrition and hydration (ANH). Clinically assisted hydration (CAH)

Citation	Aim	Care setting	Participants	Methodology	Data collection	Data analysis	Key findings	Recommendations
Critchlow and Bauer, 2002, USA ¹⁴	To explore how nurses working with elderly people view terminal dehydration.	Long-term care	64 registered nurses and licensed practical nurses	Survey	Modified Questionnaire	Descriptive analysis, correlated to demographi c variables	Age and experiences of nurses was associated with positive perceptions of terminal hydration; however, there was considerable diversity of views.	Recommendations for improvements in nurse education including how nurses can support decision-making with families.
Ke et al., 2008, Taiwan ¹⁵	To explore the knowledge, attitudes and behavioural intentions of nurses providing ANH for terminal cancer patients.	General hospital in Taiwan. Largely Buddhist or Taoist population	197 general and intensivist nurses	Survey	Self-developed structured questionnaire	Mean values and standard deviations calculated using SPSS	Nurses had reasonable general knowledge about palliative care but less knowledge of the effects of ANH. Difficulties of communicating about ANH with families and identified as one factor which influenced its provision.	Greater education regarding ANH is needed to support nurses to communicate effectively.
van der Riet et al. 2008, Australia ¹⁶	To explore the issue of family members' desire to feed patients despite them being unable to eat and drink with health care professionals.	2 palliative care units	15 nurses and doctors	Discourse analysis	2 focus groups and 4 interviews	Discourse analysis	Three discourses were identified: family members' distress at non-provision of CAH; professionals' belief that dehydration decreases suffering and polarisation between acute and palliative care settings.	Recommends communication, education and team approach. Staff need more information about pathophysiology of dying and clinical guidelines need to be developed.
van der Riet	To report on the	2 palliative	15 nurses and	Discourse	2 focus groups	Discourse	The main theme identified	Recommends exploration of

et al. 2009	discourses of	care units	4 doctors	analysis	and 4 interviews	analysis	was 'blurring boundaries'. It	mixed management
Australia ¹⁷	palliative care						refers to difficulties when	approach involving both
ļ	nurses and doctors						decisions are complex	curatively and palliative
	regarding the						because there is a tension	focused care including
ļ	management of						between actions that	consideration of ethics and
	nutrition and						promote quality of life	impact on professionals and
ļ	hydration at the						before death but may also	families.
	end of life in						prolong suffering. This is	
ļ	patients with						particularly difficult If dying	
ļ	severe brain injury						is protracted and	
	and patients with						unpredictable.	
	cancer.							
Good et al.	To explore the	Medicine,	8 medical	Qualitative	Face-to-face	Discourse	Professionals experience	More education of doctors
2011,	perceptions of	haemat-	officers	descriptive	interviews	analysis	tensions surrounding	regarding the effect of
Australia ¹⁸	doctors regarding	ology and		study			uncertainty about the	dehydration. Research
ļ	CAH for dying	oncology					transition from curative to	regarding the impact of
	patients.	units					palliative care;	reducing intake of dying
							communication with patient	patients is needed.
							and family about dying;	
							cultural expectations;	
							conflicting views about	
ļ							effects of dehydration;	
ļ							technology and the media;	
							hydration as being symbolic	
							of hope; uncertainty as a	
							battleground; and the	
							futility of treatment.	
							Negotiating transition from	
							curative to palliative care is	
							challenging for doctors, and	
							decision-making re CAH is	
	1	1	1	1			reflective of this.	

Higgins et al. 2014, Australia ¹⁹	To explore the perceptions of nurses regarding the provision and non-provision of ANH for dying patients.	Medical, oncology and haemat- ology units	Acute care nurses	Qualitative, descriptive design	Focus groups	Thematic analysis	The main theme identified was the tensions of nursing dying patients. These tensions were nurses' limited involvement in decision-making, the balancing of treatment which could comfort or cause discomfort to patients and families, managing uncertainty and considering the potential advantages of withdrawing treatment.	Palliative approach to care needed in acute care. Exploration of ethical issues nurses face in acute hospitals. Education for nurses on the effect of hydration and dehydration.
Chambaere, et al. 2014, Belgium ²⁰	To explore decisions to withhold ANH.	All care settings	Doctors of deceased patients	Postal survey	Questionnaire	Descriptive analysis then multivariate logistic regression analysis	Family often involved in decision-making (76%). Decisions to forgo assisted fluids and nutrition vary with patient characteristics: more likely for females, when dying in care home or hospital and when suffering from cancer or neurological disease.	Call for improved advance care planning. Need for early communication to promote autonomy.
Cabañero- Martínez, et al. 2016, Spain ²¹	To explore the perceptions, attitudes and opinions of health professionals regarding subcutaneous hydration of dying patents.	Specialist palliative care units registered in one of two regions of Spain.	Doctors and nurses working in specialist palliative care	Qualitative	2 with nurse focus groups and 2 focus groups with doctors	Content analysis	The relationship of the professional team and the family was important in addressing family members' emotional and informational needs. Early intentional communication focusing on emotional and informational needs is essential.	Authors recommend impact on protocols and guidelines for health management practices. A consistent approach is needed.

Studies within Narrative C: Professional support for family members of patients with diminishing drinking

Acronyms used: Artificial nutrition and hydration (ANH). Clinically assisted hydration (CAH)

Citation and location	Study aims	Study setting	Sample	Methodology	Data collection	Data Analysis	Findings	Recommendations
Clark et al., 2017 New Zealand ²²	To explore specialist palliative care practice regarding decreasing oral intake of dying patients.	Specialist palliative care including in- patient, community and hospital team	2 doctors, 8 nurses	Qualitative	One-to-one interviews	Thematic analysis	Three themes emerged. Palliative care professionals see declining intake as part of dying process. They recognise significance of this change and respond empathically, focusing on support, enjoyment and safety. Communication with family is important to professionals.	Future research into conversations of professionals and care recipients to develop care strategies and support communication.

References

- 1. Meares CJ. Primary caregiver perceptions of intake cessation in patients who are terminally ill. Oncol Nurs Forum 1997; 24(10): 1751–1757.
- 2. McClement SE, Degner LF and Harlos M. Family responses to declining intake and weight loss in a terminally ill relative. Part 1: Fighting Back. *J Palliat Care* 2004; 20(2): 93–100.
- 3. McClement SE and Harlos M. When advanced cancer patients won't eat: Family responses. Int J Palliat Nurs 2008; 14: 182–188.
- 4. Yamagishi A, Morita T, Miyashita M, et al. The care strategy for families of terminally ill cancer patients who become unable to take nourishment orally: Recommendations from a national survey of bereaved family members' experiences. *J Pain and Symptom Managemen* 2010; 40: 671–83.
- 5. Raijmakers NJH, Clark JB, van Zuylen L, et al. Bereaved relatives' perspectives of the patient's oral intake towards the end of life: A qualitative study. *Palliat Med* 2013; 27(7): 665–672.
- 6. Musgrave CF, Bartal N and Opstad J. Intravenous hydration for terminal patients: What are the attitudes of Israeli terminal patients, their families, and their health professionals? *J Pain Symptom Manage* 1996; 12(1): 47–51.
- 7. Parkash R and Burge F. The family's perspective on issues of hydration in terminal care. J Palliat Care 1997; 13: 23–27.
- 8. Morita T, Tsunoda J, Inoue S, et al. Perceptions and decision-making on rehydration of terminally ill cancer patients and family members. *Am J Hosp Palliat Care* 1999; 16(3): 509–516.
- 9. Morita T, Miyashita M, Shibagaki M, et al. Knowledge and beliefs about end-of-Life care and the effects of specialized palliative care: A population-based survey in Japan. *J Pain Symptom Manage* 2006; 31(4): 306–316.
- 10. Rurup ML, Onwuteaka-Philipsen B, Pasman HR, et al. Attitudes of physicians, nurses and relatives towards end-of-life decisions concerning nursing home patients with dementia. *Patient Educ Couns* 2006; 61: 372–380.

- 11. Cohen MZ, Torres-Vigil I, Burbach BE, et al. The meaning of parenteral hydration to family caregivers and patients with advanced cancer receiving hospice care. *J Pain Symptom Manage* 2012; 43(5): 855–865.
- 12. Torres-Vigil I, Cohen MZ, de la Rosa A, et al. Food or medicine: Ethnic variations in perceptions of advanced cancer patients and their caregivers regarding artificial hydration during the last weeks of life. *BMJ Support Palliat Care* 2012; 2(3): 275–279.
- 13. Bükki J, Unterpaul T, Nübling G, et al. Decision making at the end of life–cancer patients' and their caregivers' views on artificial nutrition and hydration. *Support Care Cancer* 2014; 22: 3287–3299.
- 14. Critchlow J and Bauer-Wu SM. Dehydration in terminally ill patients: Perceptions of long-term care nurses. *J Gerontol Nurs* 2002; 28(12): 31–39.
- 15. Ke LS, Chiu TY, Hu WY, et al. Effects of educational intervention on nurses' knowledge, attitudes, and behavioural intentions toward supplying artificial nutrition and hydration to terminal cancer patients. *Support Care Cancer* 2008; 16: 1265–1272.
- 16. van der Riet P, Good P, Higgins I, et al. Palliative care professionals' perceptions of nutrition and hydration at the end of life. *Int J Palliat Nurs* 2008; 14(3): 145–151.
- 17. van der Riet P, Higgins I, Good P, et al. A discourse analysis of difficult clinical situations in relation to nutrition and hydration during the end of life. *J Clin Nurs* 2009; 18: 2104–2111.
- 18. Good P, Sneesby L, Higgins I, et al. Medical officers in acute care settings: Their views on medically assisted hydration at the end of life. *J Palliat Care* 2011; 27(4): 303–309.
- 19. Higgins I, van der Riet P, Sneesby L, et al. Nutrition and hydration in dying patients: The perceptions of acute care nurses. *J Clin Nurs* 2014; 23: 2609–2617.
- 20. Chambaere K, Loodts I, Deliens L, et al. Forgoing artificial nutrition or hydration at the end of life: A large cross-sectional survey in Belgium. *J Med Ethics* 2014; 40: 501–504.

- 21. Cabañero-Martínez MJ, Velasco-Álvarez ML, Ramos-Pichardo J, et al. Perceptions of health professionals on subcutaneous hydration in palliative care: A qualitative study. *Palliat Med* 2016; 30: 549–557.
- 22. Clark J, Raijmakers NJH, Allan S, et al. Declining oral intake towards the end of life: How to talk about it? A qualitative study. *Int J Palliat Nurs* 2017; 23(2): 74–82.