

Online appendix

Causal mechanisms in civil war mediation:

Evidence from Syria

Magnus Lundgren
Department of Political Science
Stockholm University
magnus.lundgren@statsvet.su.se

Contents

1.	Qualitative data sources	
	a. LAS/UN documentation	2
	b. Printed and online sources	6
	c. Newspapers and electronic news sources	8
	d. Interviews	9
2.	Quantitative analysis	
	a. Table A1	10
	b. Table A2	11
	c. Table A3	12
	d. Table A4	12

1. Qualitative data sources

The below provides a non-exhaustive list of key data sources employed in the study. The great majority is publicly available material, but I have also relied on transcripts of non-public briefings that I received directly from UN officials or that were leaked by UN officials.

All sources that are cited or used for direct support of a proposition or conclusion are cited in the main text.

LAS/UN documentation

Annan K (2012) Briefing to the Security Council on the situation in Syria, 16 March 2012. Unpublished transcript.

Annan K (2012) Non-Paper: Guide-lines and Principles for a Syrian-led Transition. Unpublished transcript.

Annan K (2012) Briefing to the Security Council, 24 April 2012. Unpublished transcript. Available at: <http://www.innereitypress.com/annan1scbrief042412.html> (accessed 24 April 2012)

Annan K (2012) Briefing to the Security Council on the Situation in Syria, 8 May 2012. Unpublished transcript.

Annan K (2012) Briefing to the Security Council on the Situation in Syria, 11 July 2012. Unpublished transcript.

Arab League Resolution 7435 (16 Oct 2011)

Arab League Resolution 7438 (12 Nov 2011) [“Plan of Action”]

Arab League Resolution 7439 (16 Nov 2011) [monitoring force]

Arab League Resolution 7441 (24 Nov 2011)

Arab League Resolution 7442 (27 Nov 2011)

Arab League (2011) Arab League Monitors Protocol. Unpublished document.

Arab League (2012) Report of the LAS Observers Mission to Syria. Unpublished report. Available via: http://www.columbia.edu/~hauben/Report_of_Arab_League_Observer_Mission.pdf (last accessed 20 January 2019)

United Nations (2011) Statement by the President of the Security Council. S/PRST/2011/16.

United Nations (2011) S/2011/612 (vetoed draft resolution)

United Nations (2012) Explosion in the vicinity of an UNSMIS convoy near Dar'a. Press release. Available at:

https://peacekeeping.un.org/sites/default/files/past/unsmis/documents/Press%20Release_Explosion%20near%20UN%20convoy_09.05.12.pdf

United Nations (2012) Transcript of the press encounter with Head of UNSMIS Major General Robert Mood. Available at:

https://peacekeeping.un.org/mission/past/unsmis/documents/general_robert_mood.pdf
(accessed 10 June 2012)

United Nations (2012) Statement to the press by the Joint Special Envoy for Syria upon arrival in Damascus. Available at:

https://peacekeeping.un.org/mission/past/unsmis/documents/Statement%20to%20the%20press%20byJSE%20in%20Damascus_28.05.12.pdf

United Nations (2012) Statement attributable to Head of UN Supervision Mission in Syria, General Robert Mood, 30 May 2012. Available at:

https://peacekeeping.un.org/sites/default/files/past/unsmis/documents/press_statement_30052012.pdf

United Nations (2012) Statement attributable to Head of UN Supervision Mission in Syria, General Robert Mood, 7 June 2012. Available at:

https://peacekeeping.un.org/sites/default/files/past/unsmis/documents/UNSMIS%20statement_7%20June.pdf

United Nations (2012) Statement attributable to Head of UN Supervision Mission in Syria, General Robert Mood, 16 June 2012. Available at:

https://peacekeeping.un.org/sites/default/files/past/unsmis/documents/press_mood_16062012.pdf

United Nations (2012) Statement attributable to Head of UN Supervision Mission in Syria, General Robert Mood, 17 June 2012. Available at:

https://peacekeeping.un.org/sites/default/files/past/unsmis/documents/press_mood_170612.pdf

United Nations (2012) Opening Statement to Press by General Robert Mood Head of UN Supervision Mission in Syria. Available at:

https://peacekeeping.un.org/mission/past/unsmis/documents/UNSMIS%20Statement_050712.pdf?sID=41

United Nations (2012) Opening Statement to Press by General Robert Mood Head of UN Supervision Mission in Syria, 5 July 2012. Available at:
https://peacekeeping.un.org/mission/past/unsmis/documents/UNSMIS%20Statement_050712.pdf?sID=41

United Nations (2012) Remarks to the press by the Head of the UN Supervision Mission in Syria, General Robert Mood. Available at:
https://peacekeeping.un.org/mission/past/unsmis/documents/Remarks%20to%20the%20press%20by%20UNSMIS%20Head_13%20July%202012.pdf?sID=41

United Nations (2012) Transcript of the press conference by Hervé Ladsous, Under-Secretary-General for Peacekeeping Operations and Lieutenant General Babacar Gaye, Head of UN Supervision Mission in Syria, 25 July 2012. Available at:
https://peacekeeping.un.org/mission/past/unsmis/documents/Press%20conference_25%20July%202012.pdf?sID=41

United Nations (2012) United Nations Supervision Mission in Syria (UNSMIS) Observers enter village of Mazraat al-Qubeir. Available at:
https://peacekeeping.un.org/sites/default/files/past/unsmis/documents/Note%20to%20correspondents_080612.pdf

Syrian Government (2012) Non-paper answer of the Syrian Government to UN Envoy's six-point plan. Unpublished document. Available via:
<http://www.innercitypress.com/syria1answerICP031612.html> (last accessed 20 January 2019)

United Nations Security Council Resolution 2042 (2012) including annex ["Six-point-plan"]

United Nations Security Council Resolution 2043 (2012)

United Nations Security Council Resolution 2059 (2012)

United Nations (2012) Letter dated 10 August 2012 from the Secretary-General addressed to the President of the Security Council. S/2012/618.

United Nations (2012) Letter dated 13 July 2012 from the Secretary-General addressed to the President of the Security Council. S/2012/542.

United Nations (2012) Report of the Secretary-General on the implementation of Security Council resolution 2043. S/2012/523.

United Nations (2012) Letter dated 27 May 2012 from the Secretary-General to the President of the Security Council. S/2012/368.

United Nations (2012) Letter dated 25 May 2012 from the Secretary-General to the President of the Security Council. S/2012/363.

United Nations (2012) Letter dated 27 April 2012 from the President of the Security Council to the Secretary-General. S/2012/270.

United Nations (2012) Letter dated 24 April 2012 from the Secretary-General to the President of the Security Council. S/2012/269

United Nations (2012) Letter dated 19 April 2012 from the Secretary-General addressed to the President of the Security Council. S/2012/238.

United Nations (2012) Letter dated 10 April 2012 from the Secretary-General addressed to the President of the Security Council. S/2012/238.

United Nations (2012) Letter dated 7 April 2012 from the President of the Security Council addressed to the Secretary-General. S/2012/200.

United Nations (2012) Letter dated 24 April 2012 from the Secretary-General to the President of the Security Council. S/2012/269

United Nations (2012) Letter dated 6 April 2012 from the Secretary-General addressed to the President of the Security Council. S/2012/199.

United Nations (2012) Identical letters dated 30 March 2012 from the Permanent Representative of the Syrian Arab Republic addressed to the Secretary-General and the President of the Security Council. S/2012/187.

United Nations (2012) Letter dated 8 March 2012 from the Secretary-General addressed to the President of the Security Council. S/2012/142.

United Nations (2012) Letter dated 24 January 2012 from the Secretary-General addressed to the President of the Security Council [transmitting letter from the Secretary-General of the Arab League]. S/2012/71

United Nations (2012) Report of the Secretary-General on the implementation of Security Council resolution 2043. S/2012/523.

United Nations (2012) S/2012/538 (vetoed draft resolution)

United Nations (2012) S/2012/77 (vetoed draft resolution)

United Nations (2012) Statement by the President of the Security Council. S/PRST/2012/6

United Nations (2012) Statement by the President of the Security Council. S/PRST/2012/10. Available at: <http://undocs.org/S/prst/2012/10> (accessed 5 April 2012)

United Nations General Assembly Resolution 66/253. The situation in the Syrian Arab Republic.

United Nations General Assembly Resolution 66/176. Situation of human rights in the Syrian Arab Republic.

United Nations (2012) Transcript of the press conference by Joint Special Envoy Kofi Annan following the conclusion of the Action Group Meeting – Geneva. Transcript of statement. Available at: www.un.org/apps/news/infocus/Syria/printSyria.asp?nid=1235 (accessed 20 June 2013)

United Nations (2012) Kofi Annan Appointed Joint Special Envoy of United Nations. Public statement. Available at: www.un.org/press/en/2012/sgsm14124.doc.htm (accessed 20 June 2013)

United Nations (2012) Security Council Presidential Statement of 21 March 2012. Available via: <https://www.un.org/press/en/2012/sc10601.doc.htm> (last accessed 20 January 2019)

United Nations (2012) Advance team of UN observers arrives in Syria to report on cessation of violence. UN News wire. Available at: <https://news.un.org/en/story/2012/04/408772-advance-team-un-observers-arrives-syria-report-cessation-violence#.UJ0LgVlAX0s> (accessed 16 April 2012)

Printed and online sources

Abu-Ismaïl K and El Laithy H (2005) *Poverty in Syria: Diagnosis and Pro-poor policy considerations*. United Nations Development Programme (UNDP).

Action Group for Syria (2012) Final Communiqué [“Geneva Communiqué”]. Available at: www.un.org/News/dh/infocus/Syria/FinalCommuniqueActionGroupforSyria.pdf (last accessed 20 January 2019)

Bhardwaj M. (2012) Development of conflict in Arab Spring Libya and Syria: From revolution to civil war. *Washington University International Review* 1(1): 76-97.

Bolling J (2012) *Rebel Groups in Northern Aleppo Province*. Institute for the Study of War.

Carpenter TG (2013) Tangled web: The Syrian civil war and its implications. *Mediterranean Quarterly* 24(1): 1-11.

Chatham House (2012) *Syria: Towards a Negotiated Transition?* Middle East and North Africa Programme: Syria Study Group Meeting Summary

Droz-Vincent P (2012) *The dark side of the Syrian transition and its potentially dire regional consequences*. Norwegian Peacebuilding Resource Center (NOREF). Policy brief.

Economist Intelligence Unit (2012) *Syria Country Report* (October 2012)

Economist Intelligence Unit (2010) *Syria Country Report* (September 2010)

Foreign and Commonwealth Office (2012) Chairman's Conclusions of Friends of Syria meeting, 1 April 2012. Available at: <https://www.gov.uk/government/news/chairmans-conclusions-of-friends-of-syria-meeting--2> (accessed 2 April 2012)

Foreign and Commonwealth Office (2012) Friends of Syrian People: Chairman's conclusions, 6 July 2012. <https://www.gov.uk/government/news/friends-of-syrian-people-chairmans-conclusions> (accessed 10 July 2012)

Gowan R (2013) Kofi Annan, Syria and the Uses of Uncertainty in Mediation. *Stability: International Journal of Security and Development*, 2(1).

Greig JM (2013) Intractable Syria? Insights from the Scholarly Literature on the Failure of Mediation. *PennState Journal of Law and International Affairs*, 48

Harling P (2012) *The Syrian Heartbreak*. Middle East Research and Information Project.

Hinnebusch R (2012) Syria: from 'authoritarian upgrading' to revolution? *International Affairs* 88(1) 95-113.

Hinnebusch R and Zartman IW (2016) *UN mediation in the Syrian crisis: from Kofi Annan to Lakhdar Brahimi*. New York: International Peace Institute

Holliday J (2012) *Syria's Maturing Insurgency*. Washington, DC: Institute for the Study of War.

Inner City Press (2012) Annan's Team Reaches Out to Free Syrian Army, Deputy El-Kidwa to Istanbul, of US Dynamics. Available at: <http://www.innercitypress.com/syrialfsakofi032812.html> (Accessed 28 March 2012)

International Crisis Group (2012) Syria's Mutating Conflict. *Middle East Report*, 128

International Crisis Group (2012) Now or Never: A Negotiated Transition for Syria. *Middle East Briefing*, 32

International Crisis Group (2012) Tentative Jihad: Syria's Fundamentalist Opposition. *Middle East Report*, 131

International Crisis Group (2013) Anything But Politics: The State of Syria's Political Opposition. *Middle East Report*, 131

Kabbai N (2011) Arab Youth Unemployment: Roots, Risks and Responses. Unpublished document. Carnegie Middle East Center, Beirut, Lebanon.

Küçükkeleş M (2012) Arab League's Syria Policy. Foundation for Political, Economic and Social Research (SETA). *Policy Brief*, 56

Lund A (2012) Syrian Jihadism. *UIBrief*, 13

Patterson A and McLean C (2015) League of Arab States (LAS). In: *International Organizations and the Implementation of the Responsibility to Protect*, 110-122.

Phillips C (2012) Syria's torment. *Survival* 54(4): 67-82.

Pinfari M (2009) Nothing but Failure? The Arab League and the Gulf Cooperation Council as Mediators in Middle Eastern Conflicts. Working paper 45, Crisis States Research Center, London School of Economics

Price M, Klingner J and Ball P (2013) *Preliminary Statistical Analysis of Documentation of Killings in the Syrian Arab Republic*. Benetech.

Robinson GE. (2012) Syria's long civil war. *Current History* 111.

World Bank (2011) Country Data Report for Syrian Arab Republic, 1996-2011. Unpublished report.

Newspapers and electronic news sources

Contextual data-gathering was based on daily reading/searching of newspapers and electronic news sources, from the start of the conflict in 2011 through mid-2013. News alerts were set to keywords that included "Syria," "mediation," "Arab League," "United Nations," "al-Arabi," and "de Mistura" (including alternative spellings).

Besides news wires from major news agencies (Reuters, AFP), the majority of the contextual data were sourced from the below publications and online sites:

Al-Ahram (<http://english.ahram.org.eg/>) (Egypt)

Al-Jazeera (<https://www.aljazeera.com>) (Qatar)

Syrian Arab News Agency (<https://sana.sy/en/>) (Syria)

The Daily Star (<http://www.dailystar.com.lb/>) (Lebanon)

Al-Arabiya (<http://english.alarabiya.net>) (Saudi Arabia)

Haaretz (<http://www.haaretz.com/>) (Israel)

BBC (<http://www.bbc.co.uk>) (UK)

The Guardian (<https://www.theguardian.com/>) (UK)

The New York Times (<http://www.nytimes.com>) (US)

Interviews

1. LAS official 1, LAS Headquarters, Cairo, October 2012
2. LAS official 2, LAS London office, December 2013
3. LAS expert 1, American University Cairo, January 2013
4. LAS expert 2, American University Beirut, October 2012
5. UN/LAS expert, New York University, January 2013
6. UN official 1, Office of the Joint Envoy, November 2013
7. UN official 2, Office of the Joint Envoy, October 2013
8. UN official 3, Office of the Joint Envoy, December 2013
9. UN official 4, Office of the Joint Envoy, November 2012
10. UN official 5, Department of Political Affairs, UN Headquarters, New York
11. UN official 6, Department of Political Affairs, UN Headquarters, New York
12. UN official 7, UN Lebanon, Beirut, October 2012
13. UN official 8, UN Lebanon, Beirut, October 2012
14. UN official 9, UN Supervision Mechanism in Syria (UNSMIS), November 2012, November 2013
15. UN official 10, UN Syria, October 2012
16. Diplomat 1, Embassy of European country to Syria, Beirut, October 2012
17. Diplomat 2, Embassy of European country to Syria, Beirut, November 2012
18. Regional expert 1, Carnegie Middle East Center, Beirut, October 2012
19. Regional expert 2, Carnegie Middle East Center, Beirut, October 2012
20. Regional expert 3, American University Beirut, Beirut, October 2012
21. Regional expert 4, American University, Beirut, October 2012

2. Quantitative analysis

In the main article, I examine the effect of ceasefires on conflict intensity, as measured by the count of fatalities. The main article only reports key coefficients and statistical tests. Below, I report full regression models from which those coefficients are sourced. All models are based on de-seasonalized time series data. Table A3 and A4 reports fit statistics and deployment coefficients for the full range of ARIMA models tested.

Table A1: *Effect of IO interventions on daily fatalities (OLS trend models)*

	Dependent variable:			
	Daily fatalities			
	(1) LAS (1 month)	(2) UN (1 month)	(3) UN (2 months)	(4) UN (3 months)
Time ³	0.002* (0.001)	0.001* (0.001)	0.001** (0.0004)	0.001 (0.0004)
Time ²	-0.11 (0.07)	-0.03 (0.05)	-0.02 (0.04)	0.002 (0.04)
Time	1.62 (1.21)	0.11 (1.01)	-0.18 (0.85)	-0.57 (0.92)
LAS deployment (first month)	-7.80 (8.44)			
UN deployment (first month)		-85.56*** (14.34)		
UN deployment (first 2 months)			-86.01*** (14.07)	
UN deployment (first 3 months)				-81.11*** (13.31)
Constant	12.91** (5.45)	18.59*** (5.85)	19.75*** (5.70)	21.43*** (6.48)
Observations	317	421	452	482
R ²	0.08	0.34	0.34	0.40
Adjusted R ²	0.07	0.33	0.34	0.39
Residual Std. Error	25.11	33.52	33.49	33.51
F Statistic	6.51***	52.94***	58.27***	78.39***

Note: De-seasonalized data. Robust errors in parenthesis. Newey West estimator. *p<0.1; **p<0.05; ***p<0.01

Table A2: *Effect of IO interventions on daily fatalities (ARIMA models)*

	<i>Dependent variable:</i>			
	Daily fatalities			
	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)
	LAS (1 month)	UN (1 month)	UN (2 months)	UN (3 months)
MA(1)	-0.60*** (0.09)	-0.84*** (0.07)	-0.85*** (0.06)	-0.83*** (0.05)
MA(2)	-0.16 (0.10)			
LAS deployment (first month)	-15.4 (13.8)			
UN deployment (first month)		-72.9*** (28.0)		
UN deployment (first 2 months)			-71.8*** (26.1)	
UN deployment (first 3 months)				-74.8*** (25.7)
Observations	120	121	151	181
Log lik.	-531	-637	-789	-939
AIC	1,070	1,280	1,584	1,883

Note: De-seasonalized data. Stationarity in time series was attained by differencing ($d=1$). * $p<0.1$; ** $p<0.05$; *** $p<0.01$

Table A3: *Fit statistics for alternative ARIMA models (LAS)*

ARIMA (p,q,d)	AIC	Log likelihood	Deployment coefficient
(1,0,0)	1081	-536	10.2
(1,0,1)	1081	-535	9.45
(2,0,0)	1082	-536	9.87
(0,0,1)	1086	-539	10.6
(1,1,0)	1089	-541	-19.4
(0,1,0)	1106	-551	-14.0
(0,1,1)	1071	-533	-15.5
(0,1,2)	1070	-531	-15.4
(1,1,1)	1070	-531	-15.6
(2,1,0)	1079	-536	-15.3

Table A4: *Fit statistics for alternative ARIMA models (UN)*

ARIMA (p,q,d)	AIC	Log likelihood	Deployment coefficient
(1,0,0)	1287	-640	-41.6***
(1,0,1)	1287	-639	-43.8***
(2,0,0)	1287	-639	-42.0***
(0,0,1)	1288	-640	-41.7***
(1,1,0)	1305	-650	-53.3
(0,1,0)	1336	-666	-13.0
(0,1,1)	1280	-637	-72.9***
(0,1,2)	1281	-637	-66.1***
(1,1,1)	1281	-637	-62.2**
(2,1,0)	1295	-643	-96.2***