Who Are the "Illegals"? The Social Construction of Illegality in the United States

René D. Flores
University of Chicago

Ariela Schachter
Washington University in St. Louis

Table S1. Respondent Characteristics

	Proportion or Mean (SD)	*N*
Democrat or Lean Democrat	.481	1,484
Republican or Lean Republican	.454	1,484
Interested in Politics (yes = 1)	.461	1,504
Conservative Political Ideology (yes = 1)	.556	1,467
College Degree + (ref. = less than BA)	.554	1,507
Age	57.538 (16.326)	1,490
Woman (ref. = man)	.513	1,505

Table S2. Alternative Model Specifications, Log Odds and Standard Errors

	Logit: Suspect Illegality		Conditional Logit: Suspect Illegality		Logit: Notify Law Enforcement		Conditional Logit: Notify Law Enforcement	
	Log Odds	(SE)	Log Odds	(SE)	Log Odds	(SE)	Log Odds	(SE)
Country of Origin (ref. = Mexico)								
El Salvador	.005	(.096)	−.024	(.176)	.007	(.109)	.259	(.284)
Cuba	−.107	(.093)	−.242	(.174)	−.061	(.102)	−.438	(.276)
Argentina	−.141	(.094)	−.309	(.176)	−.050	(.108)	−.548*	(.274)
Haiti	−.165	(.099)	−.196	(.180)	.051	(.110)	−.224	(.283)
Nigeria	−.166	(.101)	−.236	(.188)	−.080	(.112)	−.018	(.290)
Somalia	−.126	(.096)	−.189	(.179)	.110	(.105)	.001	(.278)
Syria	−.027	(.095)	−.168	(.181)	.145	(.104)	.197	(.278)
Pakistan	−.216*	(.101)	−.111	(.183)	−.055	(.107)	−.159	(.275)
India	−.226*	(.099)	−.181	(.182)	−.149	(.109)	−.377	(.270)
China	−.263**	(.101)	−.256	(.180)	−.206	(.111)	−.584*	(.281)
Korea	−.276**	(.101)	−.464**	(.175)	−.058	(.107)	−.330	(.270)
Cambodia	−.198	(.102)	−.363*	(.174)	−.119	(.109)	−.354	(.290)
Poland	−.254*	(.099)	−.492**	(.181)	−.022	(.107)	−.156	(.269)
Italy	−.360***	(.101)	−.288	(.184)	−.281*	(.116)	−.470	(.287)
Canada	−.283**	(.098)	−.562**	(.183)	−.113	(.113)	−.442	(.288)
Receives Govt. Benefits (ref. = none)								
Welfare	−.033	(.061)	−.080	(.107)	.105	(.066)	−.063	(.165)
SSI	−.173**	(.061)	−.256*	(.107)	.034	(.070)	.118	(.170)
Medicaid	−.173**	(.060)	−.354***	(.106)	−.077	(.072)	−.154	(.166)
Food stamps	−.096	(.060)	−.049	(.108)	.114	(.065)	.148	(.165)
EITC	−.306***	(.061)	−.532***	(.111)	.013	(.068)	−.261	(.168)
Police Record (ref. = no record)								
White-collar crime	.509***	(.059)	.599***	(.099)	.580***	(.073)	.822***	(.147)
Violent crime	.790***	(.061)	.960***	(.099)	.911***	(.077)	1.824***	(.158)
Stereotypical immigrant crime	.914***	(.060)	1.054***	(.103)	.871***	(.077)	1.633***	(.160)
Minor infraction	.002	(.058)	−.113	(.103)	.044	(.072)	−.041	(.161)
Occupation (ref. = unemployed)								
Low-status, informal	−.054	(.053)	−.131	(.101)	−.099	(.062)	−.337*	(.160)
Low-status, formal	−.370***	(.056)	−.684***	(.100)	−.234***	(.066)	−.501***	(.151)
High-status, informal	−.143*	(.056)	−.319**	(.100)	−.204***	(.061)	−.339*	(.156)
High-status, formal	−.244***	(.055)	−.480***	(.099)	−.157*	(.063)	−.331*	(.152)
Gender (ref. = man)								
Woman	−.033	(.035)	−.037	(.063)	−.053	(.040)	−.111	(.099)
Age (ref. = 20)								
30	−.160**	(.055)	−.233*	(.101)	.022	(.062)	−.118	(.149)
40	−.221***	(.057)	−.317**	(.101)	−.131*	(.065)	−.370*	(.157)
50	−.207***	(.055)	−.349***	(.101)	−.076	(.064)	−.429**	(.147)
60	−.206***	(.055)	−.218*	(.100)	−.143*	(.063)	−.530***	(.157)
Years Living in the U.S. (ref. = 1 year)								
5	−.098	(.055)	.051	(.102)	−.058	(.062)	−.061	(.157)
10	−.129*	(.054)	−.034	(.102)	−.078	(.064)	.155	(.159)
15	−.101	(.057)	−.088	(.100)	−.046	(.065)	.016	(.156)
20	−.190***	(.056)	−.277**	(.099)	−.145*	(.063)	−.187	(.152)
English Fluency (ref. = no English)								
Adequate English	−.370***	(.050)	−.419***	(.091)	−.284***	(.055)	−.550***	(.137)
Good, accented English	−.389***	(.051)	−.543***	(.089)	−.268***	(.056)	−.548***	(.140)
Unaccented English	−.392***	(.051)	−.549***	(.090)	−.245***	(.056)	−.634***	(.137)
Education (ref. = less than HS degree)								
High school degree	−.063	(.060)	−.129	(.106)	−.062	(.067)	−.421*	(.169)
Some college	−.178**	(.060)	−.482***	(.112)	−.079	(.065)	−.383*	(.174)
College degree	−.205***	(.061)	−.407***	(.109)	−.086	(.068)	−.383*	(.170)
Master's degree	−.328***	(.060)	−.535***	(.109)	−.044	(.067)	−.234	(.167)
PhD	−.239***	(.061)	−.370***	(.108)	−.093	(.069)	−.349*	(.168)
Location of Interaction (ref. = looking for place to rent on your block)								
Attempting to board an airplane					−.438**	(.161)		
Standing outside a home improvement store					−.795***	(.167)		
Standing outside a welfare office					−.457**	(.157)		
Walking in your neighborhood					−.332*	(.150)		
Applying for a job at your place of work					.287*	(.144)		
Constant	.267*	(.123)			−.846***	(.173)		
Observations	15,109		4,894		15,174		2,490	

Note: Clustered standard errors are in parentheses (except for conditional logit models). Conditional logit models only include profile pairs where one profile is suspected and one is not.

*p < .05; **p < .01 ***p < .001 (two-tailed tests).

Table S3. Global Interaction Models by Partisanship and Education Predicting Suspicions of Illegality, Coefficients and SEs

	Republicans (Including Leaners)		Democrats (Including Leaners)		Less Than College Degree		College Degree +	
	Coef.	(SE)	Coef.	(SE)	Coef.	(SE)	Coef.	(SE)
Country of Origin (ref. = Mexico)								
El Salvador	−.042	(.034)	.037	(.031)	−.018	(.034)	.022	(.029)
Cuba	−.019	(.033)	−.021	(.029)	−.008	(.033)	−.027	(.028)
Argentina	−.040	(.032)	−.017	(.030)	−.051	(.033)	−.014	(.028)
Haiti	−.069*	(.033)	−.031	(.031)	−.046	(.034)	−.030	(.030)
Nigeria	−.068*	(.034)	−.039	(.032)	−.059	(.035)	−.018	(.031)
Somalia	−.050	(.032)	−.035	(.031)	−.036	(.033)	−.022	(.029)
Syria	−.026	(.032)	−.006	(.031)	.033	(.033)	−.030	(.029)
Pakistan	−.084*	(.035)	−.012	(.031)	−.049	(.034)	−.045	(.030)
India	−.094**	(.034)	−.019	(.032)	−.057	(.034)	−.043	(.029)
China	−.102**	(.033)	−.026	(.032)	−.053	(.036)	−.062*	(.029)
Korea	−.096**	(.034)	−.049	(.030)	−.063	(.033)	−.057	(.031)
Cambodia	−.065	(.035)	−.023	(.032)	−.052	(.035)	−.037	(.031)
Poland	−.135***	(.035)	−.001	(.031)	−.049	(.033)	−.064*	(.030)
Italy	−.130***	(.034)	−.037	(.031)	−.104**	(.034)	−.060*	(.029)
Canada	−.089**	(.033)	−.061*	(.030)	−.069*	(.032)	−.070*	(.030)
Receives Govt. Benefits (ref. = none)								
Welfare	.054*	(.023)	−.064***	(.019)	.020	(.022)	−.029	(.018)
SSI	.001	(.021)	−.093***	(.019)	−.013	(.021)	−.061***	(.018)
Medicaid	−.030	(.020)	−.051**	(.019)	−.042*	(.021)	−.039*	(.018)
Food stamps	.014	(.021)	−.046*	(.019)	−.001	(.022)	−.041*	(.017)
EITC	−.059**	(.021)	−.089***	(.019)	−.077***	(.021)	−.063***	(.018)
Police Record (ref. = no record)								
White-collar crime	.120***	(.020)	.103***	(.017)	.111***	(.020)	.106***	(.016)
Violent crime	.201***	(.021)	.147***	(.019)	.197***	(.020)	.162***	(.018)
Stereotypical immigrant crime	.216***	(.020)	.185***	(.019)	.197***	(.021)	.216***	(.017)
Minor infraction	.005	(.019)	−.010	(.015)	.010	(.019)	−.007	(.015)
Occupation (ref. = unemployed)								
Low-status, informal	−.024	(.018)	−.001	(.017)	−.018	(.019)	−.006	(.016)
Low-status, formal	−.111***	(.019)	−.064***	(.017)	−.076***	(.019)	−.085***	(.016)
High-status, informal	−.063**	(.020)	−.004	(.017)	−.036	(.020)	−.031	(.016)
High-status, formal	−.087***	(.019)	−.026	(.018)	−.049*	(.019)	−.060***	(.016)
Gender (ref. = man)								
Woman	−.004	(.012)	−.020	(.011)	−.014	(.012)	.001	(.010)
Age (ref. =20)								
30	−.049**	(.018)	−.004	(.018)	−.023	(.020)	−.045**	(.016)
40	−.033	(.019)	−.041*	(.018)	−.029	(.020)	−.064***	(.016)
50	−.037*	(.019)	−.037*	(.017)	−.040*	(.019)	−.053***	(.016)
60	−.037	(.019)	−.041*	(.017)	−.043*	(.020)	−.051**	(.016)
Years Living in the U.S. (ref. = 1 year)								
5	−.025	(.019)	−.023	(.017)	−.022	(.019)	−.022	(.016)
10	−.024	(.019)	−.040*	(.017)	−.026	(.019)	−.030	(.016)
15	−.032	(.020)	−.021	(.017)	−.036	(.020)	−.014	(.016)
20	−.047*	(.019)	−.042*	(.017)	−.051**	(.020)	−.034*	(.016)
English Fluency (ref. = no English)								
Adequate English	−.122***	(.018)	−.056***	(.016)	−.079***	(.017)	−.089***	(.015)
Good, accented English	−.122***	(.018)	−.045**	(.016)	−.088***	(.017)	−.090***	(.015)
Unaccented English	−.116***	(.017)	−.056***	(.016)	−.090***	(.018)	−.086***	(.015)
Education (ref. = less than HS degree)								
High school degree	.002	(.021)	−.034	(.019)	−.032	(.020)	−.003	(.018)
Some college	−.024	(.021)	−.063***	(.019)	−.068**	(.021)	−.025	(.018)
College degree	−.047*	(.021)	−.058**	(.019)	−.072***	(.022)	−.029	(.018)
Master's degree	−.083***	(.021)	−.088***	(.019)	−.063**	(.021)	−.084***	(.017)
PhD	−.058**	(.021)	−.054**	(.019)	−.070***	(.021)	−.046*	(.018)
Constant	.676***	(.041)	.461***	(.041)	.632***	(.042)	.498***	(.038)
Observations	6,741	6,741	7,162	7,162	6,722	6,722	8,377	8,377
R-squared	.069	.069	.048	.048	.051	.051	.059	.059

Note: Clustered standard errors are in parentheses.
*p < .05; **p < .01 ***p < .001 (two-tailed tests).

Table S4. Global Interaction Models by Respondent Region Predicting Suspicions of Illegality, Coefficients and SEs

	Midwest Region Coef.	(SE)	Northeast Region Coef.	(SE)	South Region Coef.	(SE)	West Region Coef.	(SE)
Country of Origin (ref. = Mexico)								
El Salvador	−.024	(.045)	−.017	(.053)	.039	(.038)	−.018	(.047)
Cuba	.002	(.042)	−.013	(.050)	−.008	(.038)	−.097*	(.046)
Argentina	−.029	(.042)	−.073	(.056)	−.028	(.036)	.001	(.046)
Haiti	−.048	(.043)	.010	(.054)	−.018	(.040)	−.087	(.048)
Nigeria	−.012	(.044)	.025	(.058)	−.033	(.040)	−.126*	(.050)
Somalia	−.031	(.046)	−.062	(.045)	.001	(.039)	−.036	(.047)
Syria	.007	(.043)	−.047	(.052)	.021	(.037)	−.032	(.050)
Pakistan	−.036	(.045)	−.040	(.052)	−.019	(.040)	−.102*	(.048)
India	−.054	(.045)	−.022	(.051)	−.037	(.040)	−.094*	(.047)
China	−.063	(.042)	−.091	(.052)	−.044	(.041)	−.048	(.052)
Korea	−.105*	(.044)	−.005	(.050)	−.022	(.041)	−.111*	(.050)
Cambodia	−.007	(.047)	−.032	(.056)	−.029	(.039)	−.121*	(.050)
Poland	−.013	(.045)	−.100	(.056)	−.023	(.038)	−.152**	(.047)
Italy	−.076	(.044)	−.095	(.053)	−.051	(.039)	−.113*	(.049)
Canada	−.045	(.043)	−.102*	(.048)	−.057	(.038)	−.060	(.051)
Receives Govt. Benefits (ref. = none)								
Welfare	−.012	(.027)	.001	(.034)	−.003	(.025)	−.013	(.029)
SSI	−.045	(.026)	−.079**	(.030)	−.025	(.024)	−.025	(.031)
Medicaid	−.076**	(.027)	−.020	(.031)	−.029	(.024)	−.033	(.029)
Food stamps	−.037	(.026)	−.028	(.035)	−.013	(.025)	−.018	(.027)
EITC	−.087***	(.026)	−.114***	(.032)	−.039	(.023)	−.053	(.030)
Police Record (ref. = no record)								
White-collar crime	.110***	(.026)	.147***	(.029)	.093***	(.021)	.123***	(.028)
Violent crime	.194***	(.026)	.213***	(.031)	.180***	(.024)	.143***	(.028)
Stereotypical immigrant crime	.188***	(.025)	.250***	(.031)	.204***	(.023)	.220***	(.028)
Minor infraction	−.021	(.022)	.045	(.027)	−.008	(.021)	.017	(.024)
Occupation (ref. = unemployed)								
Low-status, informal	−.017	(.024)	−.043	(.027)	−.012	(.021)	.019	(.027)
Low-status, formal	−.091***	(.024)	−.115***	(.028)	−.092***	(.022)	−.034	(.025)
High-status, informal	−.007	(.026)	−.069*	(.028)	−.057*	(.022)	.000	(.028)
High-status, formal	−.034	(.024)	−.077*	(.030)	−.076***	(.022)	−.026	(.026)
Gender (ref. = man)								
Woman	.006	(.015)	−.004	(.018)	−.002	(.014)	−.034*	(.017)
Age (ref. = 20)								
30	−.020	(.023)	−.071*	(.031)	−.017	(.022)	−.062*	(.027)
40	−.035	(.024)	−.129***	(.029)	−.036	(.023)	−.030	(.029)
50	−.067**	(.022)	−.123***	(.031)	−.001	(.022)	−.035	(.027)
60	−.058*	(.023)	−.093**	(.031)	−.029	(.022)	−.029	(.027)
Years Living in the U.S. (ref. = 1 year)								
5	.010	(.024)	−.001	(.030)	−.043*	(.022)	−.049	(.027)
10	.007	(.024)	−.040	(.031)	−.051*	(.021)	−.035	(.027)
15	−.027	(.025)	−.029	(.032)	−.032	(.021)	.004	(.029)
20	−.014	(.025)	−.035	(.032)	−.061**	(.021)	−.058*	(.027)
English Fluency (ref. = no English)								
Adequate English	−.071**	(.022)	−.082**	(.027)	−.074***	(.019)	−.118***	(.027)
Good, accented English	−.077***	(.022)	−.058*	(.026)	−.075***	(.020)	−.149***	(.026)
Unaccented English	−.065**	(.022)	−.056*	(.027)	−.088***	(.019)	−.146***	(.026)
Education (ref. = less than HS degree)								
High school degree	−.003	(.024)	−.013	(.033)	−.017	(.023)	−.016	(.033)
Some college	−.012	(.026)	−.059	(.034)	−.063**	(.023)	−.014	(.032)
College degree	−.030	(.026)	−.095**	(.034)	−.049*	(.024)	−.011	(.030)
Master's degree	−.079**	(.025)	−.043	(.035)	−.087***	(.023)	−.061*	(.030)
PhD	−.025	(.025)	−.063	(.034)	−.082***	(.024)	−.031	(.030)
Constant	.517***	(.053)	.582***	(.062)	.558***	(.049)	.570***	(.067)
Observations	4,186	4,186	2,579	2,579	5,124	5,124	3,220	3,220
R-squared	.058	.058	.075	.075	.053	.053	.065	.065

Note: Clustered standard errors are in parentheses.
*p < .05; **p < .01 ***p < .001 (two-tailed tests).

Design Appendix

Introductory Text: Next, identifying immigrants who are in the United States illegally is a government priority. In order to help us better understand this process, you will be presented with pairs of profiles describing different immigrants currently living in the United States. For each pair of profiles, please look at the information carefully, and then indicate whether you suspect each immigrant is in the U.S. illegally. Even if you aren't entirely sure, please indicate your best guess about the legal status of each immigrant.

Dependent Variable 1: Do you think these immigrants are illegal/undocumented? In other words, do you think they lack proper documentation status to be in the United States?

Response Options: Yes, No

Dependent Variable 2: Many local law enforcement organizations are asking for citizens to assist them in their efforts to identify immigrants living in the U.S. illegally.

If you saw these immigrants [location of interaction treatment], would you consider asking local law enforcement to investigate their legal statuses?

Response Options: Yes, No

See Table 1 in the main text for all randomizations

Survey Experiment Screen Shots

Figure S1. Screen Shot of Survey Experiment Introduction

Next, identifying immigrants who are in the United States illegally is a government priority. In order to help us better understand this process, you will be presented with pairs of profiles describing different immigrants currently living in the United States. For each pair of profiles, please look at the information carefully, and then indicate whether you suspect each immigrant is in the U.S. illegally. Even if you aren't entirely sure, please indicate your best guess about the legal status of each immigrant.

You will receive the following categories of information about each immigrant:

Education
Recipient of Government Benefits
National Origin
Current Area of Residence
Occupation
Years Since Arrival in the U.S.
Gender
Police Record
English Proficiency
Age

Figure S2. Screen Shot of Dependent Variable 1 and Presentation of (Randomized) Profiles

Washington University in St. Louis

Please read the two profiles carefully. Then, please indicate whether you suspect each immigrant is living in the United States illegally.

	Immigrant 1	Immigrant 2
Education	Did not finish high school	College degree
Recipient of Government Benefits	Welfare	Welfare
National Origin	Nigeria	El Salvador
Current Area of Residence	Within 10 miles of southern border	Within 100 miles of southern border
Occupation	Day laborer	Freelance graphic designer
Years Since Arrival in the U.S.	20 years	1 year
Gender	Woman	Woman
Police Record	Littering	No police record
English Proficiency	Good, accented English	Adequate English
Age	60	50

Do you think these immigrants are illegal/undocumented? In other words, do you think they lack proper documentation status to be in the United States?

	Yes	No
Immigrant 1	O	O
Immigrant 2	O	O

Figure S3. Screen Shot of Dependent Variable 3 with Randomized Location of Interaction Treatments and Presentation of (Randomized) Profiles

Washington University in St.Louis

	Immigrant 1	Immigrant 2
Education	Did not finish high school	College degree
Recipient of Government Benefits	Welfare	Welfare
National Origin	Nigeria	El Salvador
Current Area of Residence	Within 10 miles of southern border	Within 100 miles of southern border
Occupation	Day laborer	Freelance graphic designer
Years Since Arrival in the U.S.	20 years	1 year
Gender	Woman	Woman
Police Record	Littering	No police record
English Proficiency	Good, accented English	Adequate English
Age	60	50

Many local **law enforcement organizations** are asking for citizens to assist them in their efforts to identify immigrants living in the U.S. illegally.

If you saw these immigrants standing outside of a welfare office, would you consider asking **local law enforcement** to investigate their legal statuses?

	Yes	No
Immigrant 1	O	O
Immigrant 2	O	O